

JOINT OPINION BY THE EXPERTS GROUP ON THE ASSESSMENT OF A
STUDY PROGRAMME

DStP STUDY PROGRAMME

DStP - Public management and administration

Educational and scientific program of the third level (Doctor of Philosophy)

Interregional Academy of Personnel Management

Міжрегіональна Академія управління персоналом (МАУП)

(Name of HEI)

Experts:

1. **Romans Putans**, Dr.sc.admin., Head of the Department of International Business and Economics at Rīga Stradiņš University
2. **Prof. Olha Pyroh**, Dr.oec. Professor, Head of Management and International Business Department at Lviv Polytechnic National University
3. **Modris Ozoliņš**, Director of International program Department and MBA Program Innovation and Entrepreneurship at Riga Technical University, Faculty of Engineering Economics and Management
4. **Maris Lapšovs**, student representative from Rīga Stradiņš University

_____ (Date)

Summary

Experts have concluded and present this joint opinion on the analysis and evaluation of the Educational and scientific programme of the third level (Doctor of Philosophy) “Public management and administration” implemented in Kiev at the Private Joint-Stock Company “Higher Educational Institution "Interregional Academy of Personnel Management" (MAUP).

In the course of the analysis, experts have identified a number of good case practices in the programme’s implementation, management, administration and development, as well as have also identified several necessary and recommended improvements.

The major positive aspects of the programme are: The system and the model of the internal system of quality assurance of higher education and educational activities is established, publicly available and rather clearly used in practice; The positive micro-climate of the programme with clearly visible staff personal enthusiasm for the programme; The organizational education system and procedures comply with the Ukrainian legislation and are well regulated by internal documents of MAUP, incl. academic integrity policy and procedures are in place; The structure and the content of the study programme are well balanced and clearly correspond to national regulations and equally important to national strategic needs; Close communication between students and academic staff helps to understand and reach the goals of the study programme, incl. very positive feedback of PhD students about the programme’s staff attitude and qualification; The content of DStP of Public management and administration complies with the needs of the labour market and public administration in Ukraine; Good cooperation and involvement of internal and external stakeholders in the process for the development and updating of teaching materials; The relevance and quality of the available teaching materials are mostly up to date topical and rather strongly respective to PhD students` scientific interests and to the needs of the national labour market and public administration; Clear compiled list and structure of methodical guides and materials, which is also publicly available, related to the quality management of both, the format and contents, of the programme; Good structure and availability of materials and instructions on the e-studies platform; Online platforms like Moodle, Telegram and ZOOM are well used in the study process and allows students to easily get access to the classes, important literature files and the latest information; Students are well informed about their mobility options, moreover, there are experienced students, who have already come back from mobility programmes and are exchanging their experience with other PhD students; the academic staff have the appropriate professional qualifications and the necessary practical experience gained in educational projects, organizations; Supervisor’s research (sphere of interests, publications for the last 5 years) correspond with the sphere of interests of their PhD students; University academic staff and students are actively participating in research projects, through local projects, conferences and also student scientific interest circles; Clear and strong strategic aim of the PhD programme closely linked to MAUP’s strategic aim and regional, and also national development strategy - PhD programme is very much targeted toward supplementation and support of PA reforms; Good potential for PhD education export as the staff has good conduct of English and also (however still) advancing international experience; Strong cooperation with the employers and their involvement and their positive attitude, recognition for the PhD programme. Very positive and strong feedback and support for the programme from employers; MAUP has made a strong student-oriented infrastructure that allows students to solve different study problems that students can face; During the COVID-19 crisis, the MAUP successfully provided distance learning for PhD students and also helped them to continue previously started research projects, thus also gained experience for further development on distance studies and e-learning.

The fewer weaker points of the programme implementation relates to: general top to bottom performance analysis (SWOT) is not used to its full potential; having an international accreditation procedure with a large share of documents provided in Ukrainian; Duplication of the same mandatory 4 CP study course “Theory and history of public management and administration” in both master and doctoral study programmes; A major part of study course goals is similar to many other courses, which

complicates understanding the exact aim of each course; The amount of academic staff's own textbooks and scientific papers in syllabuses of the study courses are comparatively low, causing the risk of clearly unused potential for strengthening the PhD programme's scientific focuses and student-centred approach; Student questionnaires that are organised once a year are quite complex and complicated because they include information about all academic years, all courses and all teachers, causing risks of missing out on specific, important details; Low level of academic staff participation in international educational and scientific projects and scholarship programs; Slight miscommunication about number of PhD supervisors, co-supervisors, consultants among programme management, staff and students; Small number of foreign study and scientific literature of public management and administration available in the library funds; Program management is not sufficiently involved in financial planning; The financial calculation incl. the distribution of expenses is incomplete and not clear enough; Not all the supervisors have research papers (articles) (especially in journals that are indexed in Scopus and/ or Web of Science) in the sphere of interest of their PhD students; Lack of strong and clear internationalization strategy; Low level of participation in international educational and research projects, and scholarship programmes (international academic mobility of academic staff and PhD students); Lack of visiting professors from foreign higher education institutions; The number of participants in the Employers' Survey is comparatively low (8); The mechanisms of feedback analyses of the Employers' Survey for improvement of the content and quality of study programme are not clearly structured and organized; No information available on graduates, their workplace (field) and the average pay; Different and inconsistent information about supervisors of PhD students in different documents which, although might be technical or well justified (e.g. change of supervisor), can still signal serious risks in information and process management of the study and research process and programme implementation; Students can publish their research in local and MAUP journals free of charge, however, for international journals, there is no defined way how students can get financial support.

The expert recommendations are based on the wide analysis of the programme's implementation as well as on experts international experience, and aimed at correcting and improving the weaknesses, as well as at sustaining and developing further the strengths.

The overall evaluation by experts of the Educational and scientific programme of the third level (Doctor of Philosophy) "Public management and administration" is **GOOD** and the recommended accreditation period is **6 years**.

Information about the assessment procedure (timeline, expert group, scope of evaluation)

The assessment report is based on the analysis of the available information from the following major sources:

- 1) Self-assessment report (SAR) - <https://drive.google.com/file/d/12IOg4IBbY9mYnmaibbyTNpf91cXkNjMJ/view?usp=sharing>
- 2) SAR annexes and added documentation - <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/19w1QFkfwCQbhoBf0p2IfVcsqrRjNf3-5>
- 3) MAUP homepage and its sections - <https://maup.com.ua/eng/pro-akademiyu/about-maup.html>, including homepage versions in English, Ukrainian and Russian.
- 4) Other related sources of information e.g. Ukrainian national education standards and regulations available at <https://mon.gov.ua/storage/app/media/vishcha-osvita/zatverdzeni%20standarty/2020/08/05/281publichne-upravlinnya-ta-administruvannya-magistr.pdf> and <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1556-18?lang=en#Text>, prices of PhD 2021 (in Ukrainian) available at <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1kzeFBFJd2fsefCKmi7dNnqiRounSfRzS/view>; link to the

video site-visit of DStP (Kiev) available at <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/materialno-tehnichne-zabezpechennya.html>.

- 5) Experts online visit and the meetings with MAUP and StP representatives and stakeholders on 5th and 6th July 2021.
- 6) Remote discussions of the expert team members, and consensus decisions of the expert team.

The assessment procedure of the study programme was based on ten defined criteria:

- Criterion 1. Strategy, aims and programme management;
- Criterion 2. Structure and content of the programme;
- Criterion 3. Teaching and learning materials;
- Criterion 4. Techniques and methods of educational activity;
- Criterion 5. Teaching staff;
- Criterion 6. Resources;
- Criterion 7. Research work;
- Criterion 8. Cooperation and internationalisation;
- Criterion 9. Employability of graduates;
- Criterion 10. Student services.

Each criterion was assessed according to the following evaluation scale:

- Excellent – no deficiencies in meeting the set criterion have been identified;
- Good – minor deficiencies in meeting the set criterion have been identified;
- Average – deficiencies have been identified in meeting a criterion, but they can be eliminated within a short period of time;
- Poor – significant deficiencies have been identified, and they cannot be eliminated within a short period of time.

Overview of the assessment of criteria:

Criteria	Overall evaluation of the Criterion
Criterion 1. Strategy, aims and programme management	Good
Criterion 2. Structure and content of the programme	Good
Criterion 3. Teaching and learning materials	Good
Criterion 4. Techniques and methods of educational activity	Excellent
Criterion 5. Teaching staff	Good
Criterion 6. Resources	Good
Criterion 7. Research work	Good
Criterion 8. Cooperation and internationalisation	Good
Criterion 9. Employability of graduates;	Good
Criterion 10. Student services.	Excellent

General description of the University profile

Interregional Academy of Personnel Management (MAUP, in Ukrainian: Міжрегіональна Академія управління персоналом, МАУП) is a private Joint Society «Higher Educational Institution». Academy has more than 15`000 students, majority in Kyiv. Academy offers academic and professional level study programmes on 17 specialties, 93 specializations in 8 study fields` disciplines (<https://maup.com.ua/eng/pro-akademiyu/about-maup.html>) within the structure of 6 major institutes. The 6 institutes are further structurally organized by specialized departments and sub-departments, which are implementing the study programmes and organizing the study process (<https://maup.com.ua/eng/pro-akademiyu/institutions/institut-kompyuterno-informacijnih-tehnologij.html>). The educational and scientific doctoral program of the third level (Doctor of Philosophy) “Public management and administration” under evaluation is implemented at Educational-Scientific Institute of International Relations and Social Sciences, Department of Public Administration.

1.(DStP) Strategy, aims and programme management.

Ukraine is undergoing major economic and social changes during the last seven years. The public administration reform is a significant part of the package of reforms to develop a modern, democratic, human-oriented state. The public administration reform “includes the formation of an efficient public administration system that can develop and implement an integrated public policy focused on the people’s needs, sustainable social development and addressing internal and external challenges properly.” <https://www.kmu.gov.ua/en/reformi/efektivne-vryaduvannya/reforma-derzhavnogo-upravlinnya>

According to the development goals declared by the government of Ukraine, effective governance is essential for efficient government operations and is a precondition for achieving the broader government objectives of economic growth and human development. Good and efficient governance at the national level, combined with empowered local authorities, are pre-conditions to better service delivery to citizens and sustainable public funding. The first round of the Public Administration Reform (PAR) is being implemented according to the comprehensive PAR Strategy of Ukraine 2016–2020. PAR’s main objective is to develop an effective system of public administration, capable of developing and implementing coherent state policy, focused on socially sustainable development and quality public services delivery. This will include restructuring line ministries and strengthening the role of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine in providing strategic guidance for the development of a professional and ethical civil service that has the skills needed to deliver reform and change. https://www.kmu.gov.ua/storage/app/media/reform%20office/Ukraine_Reform_Conference_II_web.pdf

There is strong economic and social ground for the study programme in the field of public administration. The success of a pro-democracy, anti-corruption revolution in 2014 brought Ukraine a chance to join the countries of Central Europe in embracing democracy and the rule of law. EU and NATO integration looked likely to follow.

<https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/ukrainealert/resetting-ukraines-reforms/>

Consequently, knowledgeable and highly qualified personnel are a critical component of the success of modernizing the public administration in Ukraine. By offering the highest level (PhD) study program MAUP is playing a significant role and supporting the needs of the state. The graduates of the PhD level are able to run the scientific research in the field of public administration, as well as perform duties and develop reforms as the highest level public servants.

The goal of the educational program is *clearly defined* in the SAR (p.1 and p.3): “train highly qualified specialists in the field of management and administration ... in the field of management of organizations (institutions) in the public sector.”

The goal of the doctoral programme "Public Management and Administration" *fits the strategic directions of the Academy*, namely: “promoting the comprehensive development of human as a personality and the highest value of the society; enrichment of intellectual, creative, cultural potential of Ukraine; ... meeting the needs of society and the state in the education and development of gifted, talented and capable citizens ...”. (p.4, SAR)

The mission of MAUP is formulated quite general, however, it corresponds to the market reality and reflects the needs of Ukrainian society: "Together to the top of everyone’s professional excellence and life success for the prosperity of Ukraine" by:

- providing high-quality and socially significant higher education with the use of the latest educational technologies in order to improve constantly the educational and cultural level of the population of Ukraine and other countries;
- creating an atmosphere for self-improvement of research and teaching staff, other personal and students in the process of their joint educational, scientific, innovative and organizational activities, taking into account the personal vocation and respect for human, changes in the world;
- training recognized in Ukraine and abroad professionals of the new generation.”

The experts came to the conclusion that the study programme complies well with the aims of HEI.

The structure of the programme management corresponds to the conventional setting of higher education organizational management top to bottom approach with the information flow integrated also from bottom to top. MAUP’s higher management provides and oversees the strategic aims and support provided by general structural units (Personnel, Finances, Marketing and other), while the subordinated institute and its respective department ensures the study process. The Guarantor (the head, director) of the programme holds the major managerial and coordination responsibility of the programme management in close cooperation with the department head and the head of institute. For the PhD programme it is to be emphasized the energetic and highly engaging performance of the StP director (manager, guarantor) Inna Semenets-Orlova, who is also the head of the department. Also, the teaching staff of the StP are well engaged and contribute to the quality of the StP.

Representatives from the university student union are included in every university institution. They participate in cathedra meetings, faculty council and higher university institutions. Also, regular students who are not participating in the student union are allowed to visit all meetings and share their views regarding the study programme. Once in the year, all students can fill in an evaluation form about study courses and later this information is being used for further program development. After each academic year in cathedra meetings, academic staff go through these surveys and also analyze all information that is received from students. For students, the university provides a friendly environment for bringing new ideas and suggestions.

SWOT analysis of the study programme that is provided in the SAR (page 7 to 8) is more likely to be a SWOT “list” rather than analysis. An example - provided Weaknesses are indicated some important

problems that can affect the programme further development: “W3: the process of reviewing educational programs is not always at a sufficiently optimal speed” and indicator for this is: “Insufficient level of organization of joint participation of stakeholders in the program review process”. However, there are no other comments regarding reasons for insufficient level speed or involving neither in SWOT nor in other parts of the report. The same comment can be made also about the section “Opportunities” from O1 to O7 there is no analysis about ways MAUP can use these opportunities and also why provided opportunities are important in MAUP. More important is the fact that in the further report there are no answers to the questions of how the MAUP is solving weaknesses or using opportunities that are mentioned in SWOT. “Threats” are generally described; however, it would be more useful for the university to mention the options on how they can avoid or overcome those threats. Nevertheless, it is important to mention that “Strengths” are well described and it is beneficial that MAUP understands its advantages.

The system and procedures for admission of PhD-students in MAUP are regulated by “The Conditions (rules) of admission to postgraduate studies for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy” (link: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/abiturientam2/pravila-prijomu.html>), the Law of Ukraine “Higher Education” (dated on 01.07.2014 № 1556-VII), the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine (dated on 23.03.2016 № 261) and the Conditions of admission to Higher education institutions of Ukraine in 2021 (dated on 15.10.2020 № 1274).

All information on PhD study programme (DStP) of Public management and administration and the rules of admission are publicly available on the website of MAUP (links: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/pidgotovka-naukovih-kadriv/aspirantura.html>; <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura.html>).

The license of DStP of Public management and administration is for 25 persons per year (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UNRUP4D_GYIOka6oh6FMUyEcmChGfytv/view).

The MAUP admits full-time and part-time postgraduate students for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Public management and administration.

Admission to the PhD studies in MAUP is held 2 times a year within the time limits set by MAUP. The applicant submits an application for admission to PhD studies with all these documents accepted in the Graduate Department of the Institute of Scientific Training of MAUP (Kyiv).

For a competitive selection of candidates who enrol the PhD studies of Public management and administration are taken into account:

- the results of the exam on the speciality (in the amount of the standard of higher education of the master in the corresponding speciality);
- the results of a foreign language test according to the program that corresponds to level B2 of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages;
- the results of an additional entrance exam, if candidates who enter to PhD studies of Public management and administration from a different field of knowledge (speciality) than that specified in their master's degree (specialist) (by decision of the Admissions Committee).

The list of questions to the exam on the speciality 281 Public management and administration is publicly available on the website of MAUP (links: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1IT1S20HapHCWE2jY3cMqsdNT5SirSVL6/view>).

Also, MAUP has published the Guidelines for applicants of PhD studies on the speciality 281 Public administration and administration with all needed information (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1ID9CzqKEAB_tCowH3GaH4cy8j3ZLz6jk/view).

This system of admission seems to be sustainable, it ensures the selection of the best candidates for studies on the Doctoral Study Programme of Public management and administration. Such a selection system for entering the MAUP should also be supported in the future.

The system and the model of the internal system of quality assurance of higher education and educational activities is posted on the official website of the Academy available at <http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/sistema-yakosti/structure-systems.html> (SAR, page 5). The model shows the organizational cooperation of all the structural units of the academy involved in the quality assurance, narrowing it down to the level of departments which are further responsible for the quality implementation of the very study programme. Managing personnel at the department is also involved in discussion and decision-making at higher organization structure level through membership in respective Councils. Also during the experts` online visit to the Academy and meetings with representatives of all the groups involved (from top management to students and external stakeholders - graduates, employers), experts received affirmation of such a working system in place. The major input in internal monitoring, development and review of the study programme takes place at the department level, during the department meetings and daily work. Major involved parties are head of the department and head of the programme they are coordinating the further involvement of teaching staff (e.g. review of study courses contents in department meetings, results of students` evaluation and feedback, results of employers` surveys) and further subordinated involvement of students, graduates and employers mostly via course evaluations, surveys. Particularly for the PhD programme, also the positive micro-climate of the programme with clearly visible staff personal enthusiasm for the programme is to be emphasized as a good working mechanism for joint monitoring, ensuring and development of the study programme`s quality. Furthermore, the open and positive cooperation between students, employers and labor market is of great benefit for the internal quality system.

Strengths

1. The system and the model of the internal system of quality assurance of higher education and educational activities is established, publicly available and rather clearly used in practice.
2. The positive micro-climate of the programme with clearly visible staff personal enthusiasm for the programme.
3. The system and procedures for admission of PhD-students to the DStP of Public management and administration in MAUP comply with the Ukrainian legislation and are regulated by internal documents of MAUP. All documents for entering DStP of Public management and administration are publicly available on the website of MAUP.

Weaknesses

1. SWOT provided by MAUP do not provide a clear analysis and indicates further problems and threats in the way of possible solutions are not mentioned in the Self-Assessment report.
2. Large part of the assessment documentation provided is in ukrainian language, which is an obstacle for sufficient international evaluation. Experts base their opinion on the fact of the existence of such documentation, but cannot provide proper opinion on its contents.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

1. MAUP should pay more attention to analysis for SWOT, including brief but augmented descriptions for reasons why they are having such situations for each SWOT position.
2. The admission system for the DStP of Public management and administration in MAUP should also be supported in the future.
3. For the next accreditation and assessment of study programmes - in case of international (European) assessment ensure the english translation of the necessary documentation. Alternatively, given the fact that the study programme is aimed at domestic market, national

needs and implemented in Ukrainian language, consider the efficiency balance between 1) translating the large amount of documentation with the necessity and benefits of the international evaluation and 2) undergoing national evaluation (with no translation of documentation).

Assessment: Experts joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

2. Structure and content of the programme

The structure and the content of the study programme are well balanced, it corresponds to the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" of 01.07.2014 №1556 VII (<https://osvita.ua/legislation/law/2235/>). According to Article 5, the amount of the educational component of the educational and scientific programme of preparation of the doctor of philosophy makes 30-60 credits of ECTS. The volume of the educational component of the PhD programme submitted for accreditation is 60 ECTS credits.

According to the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education", the choice of disciplines within the limits provided by the relevant educational program and working curriculum is carried out in the amount of not less than 25% of the total ECTS credits provided for this level of higher education.

The choice of disciplines within the limits provided by the study programme and the working curriculum is carried out in the amount of 18 ECTS credits, which is 30% of the total number of ECTS credits.

The educational component of the programme is designed for two academic years. The scientific component of the programme is not measured by ECTS credits and is designed for 4 years of study (the first two years - in combination with the scientific component).

The expert group identified that the mandatory 4 CP course "Theory and history of public management and administration" is identical for both master and doctoral study programs. No clear and convincing explanation of such a contradictory case was provided during the conversation with MAUP representatives.

The DStP of Public management and administration corresponds to the speciality 281 Public administration and administration.

The main aspect of DStP of Public management and administration is "focused on the formation of intersectoral knowledge and skills, allows to solve complex specialized and practical problems in the field of professional management or learning, which involves research and innovation and characterized by complexity and uncertainty" (see SAR p. 3). This aspect is put into practice in such compulsory courses as CC1 Theory and history public management and administration, CC3 Conceptual approaches to making management decisions, CC6 Improving public administration mechanisms in Ukraine, also in some elective courses as OC1.2 E-government and e-democracy, OC1.3 World experience of the public service organization, OC1.6 Administration of public goods.

According to the SAR (p.3), the labour market of Ukraine is in need of specialists in the speciality 281 Public Management and Administration (information from the website Work.ua, HeadHunter and official websites of central authorities and analytical agencies). Also, the Law of Ukraine "Civil Service" (2015) requires that the civil services ensure as a public, professional, politically impartial

activity the practical implementation of the state tasks and functions. In particular Art. 20 states the requirements for persons applying for admission to the civil service, regarding the knowledge and skills required to pass the competition to fill a vacant position in the civil service, Art. 22. So, such needs of the labour market of Ukraine became the basis for the content of the DStP of Public management and administration.

In SAR (page 12, table 3) are provided goals for all study disciplines. The major disadvantage of this list is the fact that many goals are similar for many study courses. It seems that this is a formal part of each study course without special analysis nor specifically defined goals for each course. Nevertheless, during the two-day visit, it was made clear that academic staff and students understand goals for different courses and their role in reaching the study goals of the study programme. It is clear that communication between students and academic staff compensate gap in official documents.

MAUP representatives informed an expert's group that the interrelation of study courses is discussed every time at the end of the academic year. Also during these meetings, academic staff and students discuss the content of the study courses which duplicates each other and initiates improvements for next year. During the meeting, MAUP representatives made clear that the content of each study course is usually reviewed and improved, providing a better way to reach the goals of the study program.

The study programme submitted for accreditation has a course “Assistant practice” of 4 ECTS as an integral part of the curricula. Practice is organized and conducted according to the requirements of paragraph 2 of the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine (23.03.2016 № 261) "On approval of the procedure for training graduates of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor of Science in higher education. Practice is a mandatory component of the training of research and teaching staff. Assistant practice is organized and conducted in order to strengthen the pedagogical and analytical competencies of doctoral students.

The “Assistance practice” fits into the curricula of the doctoral study programme very well. The content of the course is integrated with other major study courses.

As this is an educational and scientific PhD programme, instead of qualification works there is doctoral thesis development throughout the studies and its defence at the end. The *Requirements for qualification work and its defence are determined by the Procedure for conducting an experiment for awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, approved by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated 06.03.2019 № 167 and other regulations.*” (SAR Annex 1 - Parameters, Certification, page 1). The topics are coming mostly from the PhD students themselves (as young scientists to be) and focused, developed in strong cooperation with supervisors.

Strengths

1. The structure and the content of the study programme are well balanced and clearly correspond to national regulations and equally important to national strategic needs.
2. Close communication between students and academic staff helps to understand and reach the goals of the study programme.
3. The content of DStP of Public management and administration complies with the needs of the labour market and public administration in Ukraine.

Weaknesses

1. Duplication of the same mandatory 4 CP study course “Theory and history of public management and administration” in both master and doctoral study programmes.
2. A major part of study course goals is similar to many other courses, which complicates understanding the exact aim of each course.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

1. Eliminate duplication of the same mandatory 4 CP study course “Theory and history of public management and administration” in both master and doctoral study programmes.
2. It is necessary to provide a better analysis of the goals of each study course. It is definitely acceptable that some goals might be the same for many courses, however, there is a need for defining unique goals for each course in their curriculums.

Assessment: Experts unanimous joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

3. Teaching and learning materials

The process for development and updating of teaching materials involves mostly teaching staff (as leaders, conductors of the study courses), students (through course evaluations and feedback), StP, department and institute`s directors (as coordinators, managers), partly employer`s representatives (through guest-teaching, Employers Council) as well as the MAUP's management via changes in legislation, strategy, socio-economic trends. The most practical work on the development and updating of teaching materials lies on teaching staff before study courses begin - to update topics, materials, literature sources. Content-wise the process for development and updating of teaching materials is supported by well-structured and publicly available MAUP`s guidelines and national regulations for professional programmes (<https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/metodichne-zabezpechennya1.html>).

The quality of the teaching materials on DStP of Public Management and Administration (in MAUP) is regulated the following internal documents:

- Regulations on the development and implementation of study programmes (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1V7lqVYJs8_B144CHP-drgKGUsabotlux/view);
- Regulations on the development of syllabuses of study courses (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KFfEvCu_NFhNTeFP-cfaxZiKXNEbGF-O0/view).

According to “Regulations on the development and implementation of study programmes” (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1V7lqVYJs8_B144CHP-drgKGUsabotlux/view), the syllabuses of study courses are updated annually or as needed. It`s affected by current changes in legislation, research in a particular field, etc.

Teaching materials (syllabuses of study courses, methodical recommendations, some textbooks in pdf-formats) are publicly available on the website of MAUP:

- syllabuses of compulsory courses: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/silabusi-normativnih-disciplin.html>;
- syllabuses of elective courses: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/silabusi-disisciplin-vilnogo-viboru.html>;
- methodical materials: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/metodichne-zabezpechennya1.html>.

The number of academic staff's own textbooks and scientific papers in syllabuses of the study courses are comparatively low, causing the risk of clearly unused potential for strengthening the PhD programme's scientific focuses and student-centred approach.

Also, teaching materials (lectures, tasks for practical classes, literature, methodical recommendation, etc.) are available on the Moodle platform of MAUP. The content of Moodle platform was presented by programme director Inna Semenets-Orlova during the site visit.

Availability of methodical guides PhD programme activities can be evaluated as good. Methodical guidance to support the quality of the PhD programme is strongly incorporated in Academy's internal monitoring and quality assurance system, e.g. *leading specialists in the field of public management and administration are periodically invited to the meeting of the methodical council of the Institute, where discussions and adjustments of the educational program take place* (SAR, p.6); also the list of methodical recommendations and materials are established, including, specifically for the PhD programme, which shows Academy's targeted guidance on the quality and development of DStP - <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura.html> (SAR, p.26, 27). These include Syllabuses of normative, selective, practical disciplines, a roadmap for the defence of thesis, entrance and exam procedures, individual curriculums, consultations and scientific research plans, manuals, textbooks and other related materials to the quality management of the format and contents of the programme.

Strengths

1. Good cooperation and involvement of internal and external stakeholders in the process for the development and updating of teaching materials.
2. The relevance and quality of the available teaching materials are mostly up to date topical and rather strongly respective to PhD students' scientific interests and to the needs of the national labour market and public administration.
3. Clear compiled list and structure of methodical guides and materials, which is also publicly available, related to the quality management of both, the format and contents, of the programme.

Weaknesses

1. The amount of academic staff's own textbooks and scientific papers in syllabuses of the study courses are comparatively low, causing the risk of clearly unused potential for strengthening the PhD programme's scientific focuses and student-centred approach.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

1. Increase the number of academic staff's textbooks and scientific papers in the syllabuses of courses. This may be particularly beneficial for strengthening the PhD programme's scientific focuses and student-centred approach.

Assessment: Experts unanimous joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

4. Techniques and methods of educational activity

The development and application of teaching methods are mainly organized through interaction and experience exchange of the programme's teaching staff as well as taking into account the results of courses' evaluations and feedback by students. The PhD programme with its staff - director and teaching staff - takes into account that individually specialized and focused research topics also require an individual approach to the application of research methods.

At the end of each academic year, students can fill in an evaluation form. They can leave feedback about all study courses, academic staff and suggest improvements for the future. For the 1st year applicants a special separate questionnaire is developed (with open-ended questions) (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/17cOPZS-cX0jQBXuOnq9OYH4QP00QVGD/View>), and also a special form for 2nd to 4th year students (tests and open-ended questions) (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1gXPYxHboTwqVkv-__eKv9K4xsuGbotfP/View). The survey on the quality of the educational process was conducted in September 2020 (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1dKDXK6fElReEc2mzEirN1hfKx7aHgAhp/View>), 20 students were interviewed. At the end of each academic year in cathedra meetings, the academic staff go through these surveys and also analyze all information that is received from students. However, the feedback receiving process needs to be made transparent and mentioned in the quality assurance policy of MAUP.

MAUP has a number of internal regulatory documents related to academic integrity:

- Code of Academic Integrity: (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1r74_4CHxDx1bpAvw8X4AvaqLSGWbyaYd/View);
- Regulations on the prevention and detection of plagiarism in scientific and academic texts: (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1Mj5N2nBwssIworXaa6bx5sO6fjcuH8nJ/View>);
- Regulations on the verification of academic and scientific texts for plagiarism and their placement and storage in the institutional repository of PJSC HEI "MAUP": (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1fjNHCCLkQlfXRn9KD9twEmiRxNC07ZEv/View>).

Specialized tools like Unicheck.com and Plagiat.pl are applied to identify and prevent plagiarism cases. In addition, some anti-plagiarism Internet tools are applied, as well (<https://text.ru/antiplagiat/5d42d6ca6d273> or <https://content-watch.ru/text/>).

Academic integrity as a positive practice is popularized in the HEI through the constant explanatory work of the commission for monitoring the quality of education; study of best practices of other HEI, etc. Students are constantly informed about the inadmissibility of plagiarism (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/v-akademii-vidbuvsya-seminar-z-pitan-zastosuvannya-kompyuternih-zasobiv-viyavlennya-plagiarism.html>);

The guarantor and the project group of the educational and scientific program organize different events to promote the theme of academic integrity among the students of MAUP. Some of such events targeted at strengthening academic integrity are presented in the SAR (pp.29, 30).

The expert team had a number of discussions with students, faculty and administration of MUAP devoted to the academic integrity issues. No serious risk of academic dishonesty has been identified.

The PhD programme clearly shows a student-centred approach, mostly focusing on the very core of the PhD programme - the scientific research on PhD thesis and developing students' skills and competencies in scientific activity e.g. Scientific Colloquium for PhD students are being organized in addition to their Curricula to support their thesis in a partly informal way including to test their pedagogical and supervisory skills. Each PhD student has two supervising academic staff members. A

very good practice is to spend the first 6 months in the programme mostly working with scientific supervisors on the PhD topics, research, its development and only then the study courses are starting. Also, during the expert visit in the meeting with PhD students, students` clearly confirmed the student-centred approach. Experts received very positive feedback from students about the programme`s staff.

During the expert visit in the additional meeting of the StP directors, experts were shown the PhD programmes Moodle (e-studies) system - the structure of e-studies, the materials available (syllabus, topics, literature, tasks, grading) are fully sufficient for independent studies of PhD students supervised by course leaders.

Students are allowed to apply for mobility programs in MAUP partner university programs in Ukraine and other countries (as was mentioned during meetings - Poland and Czechia). Furthermore, the Academy involves graduate students in the activities of partner institutions, including in the framework of Erasmus + programs (http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/uchast-uvnesnyanij-shkoli-v-ramkah-programi-imeni-zhana-mone-erasmus.html?fbclid=IwAR0AsHenhOJKjiQQ-YAubH-Lq8lcL_p257n2PWiuRecRqsdiIGzrus4Gyg). PhD students are being regularly informed regarding the mobility programs during meetings with teaching staff and also in first university days as freshmen. During the experts` online visit to MAUP and meeting with students, experts learned that few students have used mobility opportunities and few are using international cooperation opportunities remotely.

Strengths

1. Academic integrity policy and procedures are in place. No cases of academic dishonesty have been identified by the expert team.
2. Very positive feedback of PhD students about the programme`s staff attitude and qualification.
3. A comparatively large number (~60) of PhD students.
4. Good structure and availability of materials and instructions on the e-studies platform.
5. Students are well informed about their mobility options, moreover, there are experienced students, who already came back from mobility programmes and are exchanging their experience with other PhD students.

Weaknesses

1. Student questionnaires that are organised once a year are quite complex and complicated because they include information about all academic years, all courses and all teachers, causing risks of missing out on specific, important details.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

1. It would be easier for students and more beneficial for the programme to organise student evaluation questionnaires at the end of each semester, and also organise separate forms for each study course.

Assessment: Experts joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **EXCELLENT**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
X				

5. Teaching staff

Procedures for attracting and/employing qualified academic (teaching) staff in MAUP have been fully described in SAR of DStP of Public management and administration (MAUP). The procedure has been developed on the basis of the requirements of Law on Ukraine “Higher education” and the internal regulations of MAUP: “Regulations on the election and employment of research and teaching staff” (link:

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B0yEyg903WzkZnU4SEVTU1FVY3ZaUTUxM0JxMFIZMFF4bW9J/view>) and “Regulations on the conclusion of contracts for the employment of research and teaching staff” (link: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B0yEyg903WzkTUpOeTN3SXduMGs/view>).

The documents provide all the necessary information on procedures for attracting and/employing qualified academic staff in MAUP. It has been stated that apart from formal requirements, the applicant can also be asked to conduct an open lecture, practical session or seminar. There are no requirements that correspond with the uniqueness of the study programme (for example, DStP of Public management and administration) in the hiring process. The opinions of the students are heard, too, when making the hiring decisions and can be used in the consideration of the hiring committee decision.

During the experts' visit in meeting with staff, programme management and students, the experts obtained an impression that there might be two staff members as supervisor, co-supervisors and scientific consultant for a PhD student for the thesis. In such a way it was perceived to ensure that the topic is both - scientifically researchable and practically applied, however with the meeting with students some would say they have one and some that they have two supervisors, which is a slight miscommunication which should be solved, clarified, specified in order to avoid process and information management risks.

According to compliance of the qualification of academic (teaching) staff of DStP of Public management and administration with Licensing conditions for the implementation of the Doctor study programme, it has been stated that the teaching staff should have the appropriate professional qualifications, academic title, degree and the necessary practical experience gained in educational projects, organizations etc. that generally meet the conditions of DStP of Public management and administration.

The analysis of the data on scientific and pedagogical staff (link: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/portfolio-vikladachiv1.html>) indicated that both the qualification and the academic titles are appropriate for all the academic staff. The academic staff of DStP of Public management and administration consists of 10 staff members by the following position:

- 4 Professors all holding doctoral or PhD degree and one Head of Department who holds Doctoral degree of Science in Public Administration;

- 5 Associate Professors out of which 3 hold PhD degree and 2 are Candidates of Science.

According to SAR, all academic staff involved in the educational process underwent advanced training at the Higher School of Management of MAUP under the program of Public Administration on the latest global trends in the science of public administration and administration during September 2-25, 2020. (link: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/portfolio-vikladachiv1.html>).

All academic staff have scientific papers (articles, thesis, monographs, textbooks) that were published during the last 5 years, except one Associate Professor who had articles and textbooks during 2013-2015 years, and only conference thesis – during the last 5 years.

According to the information provided in SAR and communication with faculty and administration of MAUP, the experts recognized that the MAUP has a well-established system of professional development of faculty. A number of different mutually interrelated events are taking place each year.

Methodological assistance is available to the departments. Masterclasses are taking place to share the best experience and support professional development. Junior faculty members get individual support from their experienced colleagues.

Faculty members can take part in the annual professional development activities offered by the Higher School of Management of MUAP (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/programa-mba.html>).

An extensive list of professional and pedagogical activities performed in 2021 is presented in SAR (p.p.37,38).

MUAP provides opportunities to publish articles in collections published by MUAP. International publications are co-financed by the Academy.

According to the SAR, the workload of the faculty is quite balanced. The annual workload of the faculty members of MAUP is formed from teaching, methodical, scientific and organizational activities. The planned average weekly workload of the research and teaching staff is on average 36 hours. The typical workload of the faculty member is distributed as follows: study load – 30...40%; methodical work – 15...30%; scientific work – 30...40%; organizational activities – 5...20% of the total workload. The maximum study load of a research and teaching staff is 600 hours per academic year.

According to the discussions with faculty members, the expert team identified that the real workload of the faculty sometimes is higher. But, that can not be considered a shortcoming as academic and scientific personnel are working hard all over the world.

The workload for the next academic year is planned till the June of the previous academic year.

Academic staff of MAUP get the information on academic mobility (all-Ukrainian and international conferences, seminars, scientific schools, international projects, internships, webinars from the MAUP's partners, research institutions, higher education institutions and civil society institutions) in the various ways:

- announcements of the Facebook page (link: <https://www.facebook.com/groups/565839287567176/>);
- Viber groups, social media pages, website and information boards, the department disseminates information;
- website of the Public Administration Department (link: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya.html>).

International mobility of academic staff is limited. According to SAR and additional documents (link: https://drive.google.com/drive/u/0/folders/129bXsvS2TyLj8f_69qalVxYrjSKieS2n), the most active in international academic mobility took part the programme director.

The academic staff of MAUP mostly is involved in the internal mobility between the branches of MAUP and Ukrainian higher education institutions (Kherson National Technical University, Lviv National University of Veterinary Medicine and Biotechnology, Kyiv National Economic University named after Vadym Hetman, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv).

The cooperation of academic (teaching) staff in the implementation of the study programme is good. During the implementation of DStP of Public management and administration, all issues that arise are discussed during the regular meetings of the Public Administration Department (link: https://drive.google.com/drive/u/0/folders/1B9FUAwA9N-EUbaPE7XG_9Zidem7qtvJ1).

Strengths

1. According to Licensing conditions, the academic staff of DStP of Public management and administration have the appropriate professional qualifications, academic title, degree and the necessary practical experience gained in educational projects, organizations.

2. Academic staff of DStP of Public management and administration are mostly involved in the internal academic and scientific mobility in Ukraine and between the branches of MAUP.
3. According to the SAR the workload of the faculty is quite balanced. Faculty members are involved in teaching, they are performing methodical and scientific work, as well as organizational activities.

Weaknesses

1. Low level of academic staff participation in international educational and scientific projects and scholarship programs.
2. Slight miscommunication about number of PhD supervisors, co-supervisors, consultants among programme management, staff and students.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and for further development

1. To promote academic staff for submitting applications of participation in international education and/ or research projects and scholarship programs.
2. To keep clear track of PhD students' supervisors and co-supervisors, informing also the very students about them.

Assessment: Experts unanimous joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

6.Resources

Quite poor information about the financial resources and financial sustainability is provided in the SAR for evaluation. As far as the experts acquired from the discussions with MUAP representatives, financial planning and distribution of income are done in a very centralized way. The institute or program level management is not involved in financial planning. According to the request of the accreditation agency MAUP provided some extra information regarding the tuition fee and distribution of finances. (Financial expenses.docx) According to the information acquired from MAUP, some 62% of income goes to covering expenses. 54% of income is allocated for the remuneration of faculty, which is quite a reasonable proportion for the doctoral programme. Actually, it has the potential to increase remuneration. The structure of the rest of the expenses is questionable and needs extra clarification. Taking into consideration the sufficient number of students and the tuition fee, the experts can assume that the study programme is financially self-sustainable.

According to the SAR (p.40), sufficient reasonableness of funding requires regulation by the financial and planning department of accounting to agree with the Supervisory Board of the Academy and the guarantor of the educational program.

The infrastructure of President University (Kyiv, Ukraine) includes the educational premises, the library and the reading hall, the computer classes, the assembly hall, equipped auditoriums, the sports hall and two sports grounds, the cafeteria. The President University has properly organized fire safety and accessibility of the environment for people with disabilities. Living conditions in the dormitories are properly organized.

In general, educational and methodological support of DStP of Public management and administration encourages the achievement of goals and program learning outcomes which are defined for the study program under evaluation.

President University of MAUP (Kyiv) mentioned above has classrooms equipped with multimedia boards and projectors. The educational environment is safe for the life and health of PhD-students and allows them to satisfy their needs and interests. All classrooms, staff rooms, teacher rooms, training and support facilities meet health and fire safety requirements.

According to the provided information, MAUP has a well structured and organized library (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1it_11WqwoUT8xvsXlP2jdjfNyqUwCFH3/view). Students got access to different literature sources that can be reached in person or also in an online format. Every year the library renews its sources with new literature that is required by students or determined by modern tendencies in the current study field. The main periodicals and methodical editions of Ukraine are subscribed.

Educational and methodological support of the study programme – DStP of Public management and administration allows achieving the goals defined by the study programme. Students have access to the electronic library of the International Library and Information Center named after Yaroslav the Wise MAUP.

Moodle platform for PhD students is well organized and helps to reach all goals defined by the study programme. In e-platform students have access to mandatory literature sources, information about each study course and also goals that are needed to be reached. Moreover, during COVID-19 lock-down period students were able to continue distance learning by using Moodle, ZOOM and Telegram platforms.

For PhD students, MAUP has a Moodle e-platform, that allows students to better prepare for classes and find all essential information. During the visit, the StP director showed that the Moodle platform is well organized and has all that is needed for students, including literature lists, links to important databases, lecture files and also teacher contacts.

MAUP also provides a ZOOM platform that allows organising online lectures and classes. This option played a crucial role during the COVID-19 pandemic. For better communication with students, MAUP is using the Telegram channel that allows the fast exchange of information and the ability to notify students about actualities and news.

All the relevant information of DStP of Public management and administration is timely and sufficiently published on the official website of MAUP (link: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/osvitno-naukova-programa.html>). During the review of the website, the Expert group came to the conclusion that all public information is correct, up-to-date and provides sufficient information to the external users, including potential PhD-students.

Strengths

1. Online platforms like Moodle, Telegram and ZOOM are well used in the study process and allows students to easily get access to the classes, important literature files and the latest information.

Weaknesses

1. Small number of foreign study and scientific literature of public management and administration available in the library funds.
2. Program management is not involved in financial planning.
3. The distribution of expenses is incomplete and not clear enough.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

Short-term recommendations:

1. Increase the number of foreign study and scientific literature of public management and administration available in the library funds.

Long-term recommendations:

1. Consider involving the program level management in financial planning. Integrate responsibility of the program level management in achieving the financial results.
2. Improve the budget calculation procedures.

Assessment: Experts unanimous joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

7. Research work

For the DStP of Public management and administration, there are 25 supervisors for the current number of 79 PhD-students studying on DStP of Public management and administration (link: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1VX4PGuGC8gARRtKqmjUpH03HMgwYh-2X/edit#>).

All supervisors of PhD students are specialists (professionals) in their own spheres of research. Supervisor's research (sphere of interests, publications for the last 5 years) correspond with the sphere of interests of their PhD-students and have scientific publications together with them.

Sphere of scientific interests of supervisors – academic staff of DStP of Public management and administration:

- public administration of educational change and implementation of educational reforms - Doctor of Public Administration Semenets-Orlova I.A.;
- civil service reform - Doctor of Public Administration Romanenko Eu.O.;
- economic reform and development of private property - Doctor of Science in Public Administration Nepomnyashchy O.M., PhD in Public Administration Perestyuk I.M.;
- development of leadership in the civil service - Doctor of Science in Public Administration Akimov O.O.;
- anti-corruption practices, lobbying in the system of public administration – PhD in Public Administration Yarovoy T.S.;
- public information policy - PhD in Public Administration Zhukova I.V.;
- state social policy, sustainable development of regions - Doctor of Sciences in Public Administration Balashov A.N.;
- public administration in the field of health care - Doctor of Sciences in Public Administration Zyma I.Ya.

Scientific collaboration between academic staff (supervisors) and PhD-students are implemented in the following ways:

- publish research papers in the Ukrainian and international journals;
- take part in International Conferences (links: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1_IKQvQDa8fekwdStYY-

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1ADKDCveT7hUqEViJ7hGLsucnvznT5-N2/view?usp=drivesdk>;
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/15ngJgssIqq2HUWcOGdtnOQH55214hQuB/view?usp=drivesdk>) and Scientific Competitions (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1wcUmsgPloxkh6YA-gNiIdJad_bCSZ1ci/view);
 - take part in the department's research work "Development of Public Management and Administration in the context of systemic sectoral reforms: social, economic, security and cultural aspects" (no. 0121U110533; <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/navchalno-doslidnicka-laboratoriya-ta-naukovij-gurtok.html>).

During the site visit (meeting with academic staff in Kyiv) the Expert group obtained the facts that the management of MAUP understands the importance of scientific research in the implementation of DStP of Public Management and Administration and uses a sufficient number of tools to ensure a sufficiently high research level:

- the education establishment management actively stimulates scientific activities of academic staff, paying the publication fee in high-level scientific journals, which are in the internationally cited database (Scopus; Web of Sciences);
- the publication of academic staff research in the database of Scopus and Web of sciences envisages one-time bonus payments.

As a positive practice on DStP of Public management and administration are the joint lectures, scientific and communicative activities with scientists and experts from other institutions of higher education, scientific organizations and public authorities (links: <http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/lekciya-disput-osoblivosti-nacionalnoi-bezpeki-v-umovah-globalnih-viklikiv.html>; <http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/lekciya-disput-prozhitkovij-minimum-ta-bazovi-socialni-standarti-v-ukraini.html>; <http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/uspishno-zavershilasya-zimova-shkola-dlya-aspirantiv.html>; <http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/novini1/usi-novini1/uspishno-zavershilasya-zimova-shkola-dlya-aspirantiv.html>).

Based on the information provided in the SAR, which was confirmed during the discussions with students, as well as academic and administrative staff, doctoral students and faculty are actively involved in research.

The faculty members conduct different scientific activities. Those activities are confirmed by quite rich outputs. In 2020 8 textbooks and 12 monographs have been prepared for publication. Three doctoral dissertations and 19 candidates of sciences dissertations by staff members of MAUP have been defended in 2019/2020. As the SAR of PhD programme is rather lengthy containing also quite some additional information about MAUP and departments additional activities that are to some extent less relevant to the very PhD programme (which is misleading and can be considered as weakness of information management and PhD programme's administrative performance), experts had to clarify information about actual PhD graduates and information provided in SAR. On July 28, 2021 MAUP representatives via email clarified that in academic year 2019/ 2020 there were 19 PhD thesis defended of the academic staff members. These academic staff members are not involved in the teaching of this study programme. It should be noted that in the structural unit of Public Administration more than 100 lecturers are involved that are reading courses on various levels – Bachelor level and Masters level. So out of those lecturers, 19 have obtained a PhD degree to indicate the professional development of the academic staff. Experts would like to point out that the PhD programme has good potential in reflecting its specific achievements (including in research work) which should be distinguished more clearly from

the achievements of the department, MAUP and their collegial performance, particularly the ones that have no involvement in the PhD programme.

32 scientific articles by the full-time faculty members have been published in 2020, 12 of them are indexed by Scopus. The faculty is also active in supervising scientific activities. 61 doctoral students were supervised by the MAUP faculty in 2020. Scientists of the Department of Public Administration participate actively in conferences, symposia, and seminars.

According to the information presented in the SAR (p.52), 79 postgraduate publications, both prepared individually and co-authored with supervisors, have been published in the electronic and paper format in 2020.

From the list of postgraduate student publications 89 are published in home periodicals, and 9 are in foreign ones, 8 publications are in foreign languages. 38 publications are publications of abstracts of international and national conferences, and 40 are scientific articles in professional publications.

The topics of the articles are various, as well as the topics of scientific dissertation research. One of the most common areas of research is research in the field of public administration, in the field of national security and defence, information security, cybersecurity and tax security. The problems of reforming the healthcare system and communication of authorities with citizens in a pandemic are also considered. The direction of research in comparing home public administration and European practices is important, so postgraduate students analyse and propose methods for quality implementation of reforms in Ukraine, based on world experience. The next important area of research is the use of human potential in the field of public administration, development of management civil servants' culture and prevention of corruption.

Research work is carried out on the basis of the agreements and approved topics (<https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/naukovo-doslidnicka-robota.html>).

It is worth mentioning that there are possibilities to participate in the activities of the student-postgraduate scientific circle at the graduating department "Gloria victoribus" (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1FawvhoBcPIM1UjAuAiE3R9Ve5eI-Ohoj/view>). During the meetings of the circle, applicants for bachelor's and master's degrees of higher education and the level of doctor of philosophy have opportunities to organize joint mini-projects and discussions. Graduate students also have a great opportunity to mentor students in writing their first scientific publications. The thematic group of meetings of the circle can be found at the link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/13mMvijGdhKmpeM7UfMJ7hut_Z1brUhv4/view.

Research work is carried out on the basis of concluded agreements and approved topics (<https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd-doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/naukovo-doslidnicka-robota.html>). According to the Self-Assessment report - there are 79 positions of postgraduate publications, both made individually and together with supervisors. Including 66 have been published and 13 have been submitted for publication and will be published in electronic and paper form from a month to six months. From the list of publications, 89 are in home periodicals, and 9 are in foreign ones, 8 publications are in foreign languages. It is worth noting that 38 publications are publications of abstracts of international and national conferences, and 40 are scientific articles in professional publications.

Study programme academic staff are active researchers and in the PhD study programme, they are responsible for study courses that are connected with their research field. PhD students during the theoretical classes are having options to join academic staff research groups and under the umbrella of

their project develop their PhD research. PhD students have mandatory criteria to participate at least twice a year in scientific conferences and also publish their research in local scientific literature. According to academic staff and students, these criteria are well motivating to reach scientific goals.

Strengths

1. Supervisor’s research (sphere of interests, publications for the last 5 years) correspond with the sphere of interests of their PhD students.
2. University academic staff and students are actively participating in research projects, through local projects, conferences and also student scientific interest circles.

Weaknesses

1. Not all the supervisors have research papers (articles) (especially in journals that are indexed in Scopus and/ or Web of Science) in the sphere of interest of their PhD students. Mostly, the supervisors have the conference thesis that corresponds to the sphere of interests of their PhD students.
2. The SAR (self-assessment report) of the PhD programme is rather lengthy containing also quite some additional information about MAUP and department’s (and other departments) additional activities that are from some to substantial extent less relevant to the very PhD programme, particularly the ones that have no involvement in the PhD programme.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

Short-term recommendations:

1. PhD programme’s performance and achievements (including in research work) should be distinguished more clearly from the achievements of the managing department, other departments, MAUP in general and their collegial performance, particularly the ones that have no involvement in the PhD programme.

Long-term recommendations:

1. To activate the publishing activity of academic staff (supervisors) in journals that are indexed in Scopus and/ or Web of Science.

Assessment: Experts unanimous joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

8. Cooperation and internationalization

No formal cooperation and internationalization policy documents are presented for evaluation. Analysis of internationalization activities is not presented either. However, during the discussions with administration and faculty members, cooperation with higher education institutions is taking place. Mainly cooperation is carried out in such forms as faculty training, some researchers are participating

in international projects. The experts found out that faculty members are active in participation at different international events, which is confirmed by numerous certificates.

In the experts' visit during the discussions with the programme management and staff, the experts noticed very good conduct of English and rather global-trended vision of programme's guarantor and staff members, which might signal for good potential for PhD education export as the staff has good conduct of English and also (however still) advancing international experience.

In MAUP, the cooperation agreements with certain foreign higher education institutions have been concluded in recent years (link: https://drive.google.com/drive/u/0/folders/1ev5nGY2OEvpv9uDURqS9SDkkjI_z_HGJ): Burgas Free University (Burgas, Bulgaria; Agreement dated on 29.10.2019), Warsaw Management University "Collegium Humanum" (Warsaw, Poland; Agreement dated on 04.09.2018), Wyższa Szkoła Bezpieczeństwa Wewnętrznego (Lodz, Poland; Agreement dated on 19.04.2019). The agreements provide, in particular, opportunities for mutual academic mobility.

In September 2020, MAUP and Wyższa Szkoła Bezpieczeństwa Wewnętrznego (Lodz, Poland) held the joint scientific-practical conference as the result of scientific cooperation (link: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1PNhAtu5Lr3cy9AG5rkgYTzhIVWeEVnpS/edit>).

There are cooperation agreements concluded by the President University of the MAUP (Kyiv) with a number of institutions in Ukraine – public institutions and Higher education institutions in the field of public management and administration. In particular, on DStP of Public Management and Administration:

- with the Department of Education and Science of Bila Tserkva City Council of Kyiv region (Bila Tserkva, Ukraine) (Agreement dated on 12.01.2021) (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/1hRy9yOBKpHxfVRZkkSvAHgOJU_53CeOe/view). This cooperation agreement aims to conduct research in the field of public administration in education, taking into account the achievements of leading Ukrainian and Foreign scientific schools;
- with Kyiv National Economic University named after Vadym Hetman – collaboration in the sphere of pedagogical internships;
- with the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv – collaboration in publishing textbooks.

Academic staff (mainly professors) from DStP of Public Management and Administration (President University of the MAUP, Kyiv) are invited to give guest lectures in other higher education institutions and the teaching staff from other higher education institutions from Ukraine are invited to give lectures at President University of the MAUP.

The system and procedures for attracting teaching staff and students from abroad are not presented in the SAR. Very limited information of international mobility activities is the accreditation documents. Analysis of the international staff and student mobility is not provided. As it can be understood from the SAR, major attention to the international mobility of faculty is paid to faculty training and development.

The procedure of recognition of learning outcomes obtained in other institutions of higher education is regulated in the MAUP by item 13 of "Regulations on the organization of the educational process in PJSC HEI MAUP" https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UK3JkulPnOnH5_PBkRMKwpuNY4ip-4Ru/view?usp=sharing, which stipulates that the student provides a standard academic certificate confirming the implementation of the educational program in another HEI and contains information about learning outcomes and reports on the implementation of the individual curriculum. The MAUP

in the prescribed manner at the request of the relevant department enrolls the results of training in another HEI.

Strengths

1. Academic staff of DStP of Public management and administration are involved in the internal academic and scientific mobility in Ukraine and between the branches of MAUP.
2. Clear and strong strategic aim of the PhD programme closely linked to MAUP’s strategic aim and regional, and also national development strategy - PhD programme is very much targeted toward supplementation and support of PA reforms.
3. Good potential for PhD education export as the staff has good conduct of English and also (however still) advancing international experience.

Weaknesses

1. Lack of strong and clear internationalization strategy.
2. Low level of participation in international educational projects (international academic mobility of academic staff and PhD students).
3. Low level of participation of academic staff and PhD students in international research projects and scholarship programs.
4. Lack of visiting professors from foreign higher education institutions.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

Short-term recommendations:

1. Promote academic staff for submitting applications for participation in international research projects and scholarship programs.

Long-term recommendations:

1. Attract the visiting professors who are specialists in the sphere of public management and administration from foreign higher education institutions.
2. Intensify the participation of academic staff and PhD students in international educational projects.
3. Develop a comprehensive plan for internationalization in order to strengthen the ground for integration into the international education space.

Assessment: Experts joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

9. Employability of graduates

The goal of DStP of Public management and administration is “to train highly qualified specialists in the field of management and administration, who are able to solve significant complex problems in the

field of professional activity, science and/ or innovation, to conduct their own research and innovative activities with the appropriate level of academic integrity to obtain new practical results in the field of management of organizations (institutions) in the public sector” (see SAR, p. 3).

Such a goal corresponds with the Ukrainian labour market needs. According to the SAR (p.3), the labour market of Ukraine needs professionals in the speciality 281 Public Management and Administration.

According to SAR (criterion 9. – see pp. 53-54), there is no information on graduates’ employment. During site-visit to MAUP, the Expert group did not obtain the information (facts) about graduates and their employment.

Analysing the information of “Councils for the Defence of PhD Dissertations” (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/12nsmCKmokTHpK5TqF_574jWDDDPk9krF/view), the Expert group found information that 4 PhD-students of DStP of Public management and administration defended their PhD thesis in front of the Councils of MAUP during 2020 -2021 years: Al-Atty Iryna (defended 17.02.2020), Kanan Ayub (defended 19.08.2020), Ibrahim Suleiman Hannam (defended 09.12.2020), Chmyr Yaroslav (defended 21.05.2021). Also, the Expert group found the facts of issuing the PhD Diplomas to the following PhD-students: Al-Atty Iryna (Order of MAUP, dated 21.05.2020, #2256-n), Kanan Ayub (Order of MAUP, dated 08.10.2020, #49-76-n), Ibrahim Suleiman Hannam (Order of MAUP, dated on 24.02.2021, #749-n) (links: <https://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-ua-maup/pidgotovka-naukovih-kadriv/zahisti-zdobuvachiv.html>; https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KeXx-utjgIzbAPpAvU1U1QeYg4Vd9d_B/view; <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1-8jvCwmZbrEfVzNqHYDMRzz7VVh1xkC9/view>). Although this information contradicts to initially submitted SAR (according to page 171 “Indicators of student contingent formation” the PhD programme has had so far 1 graduated student from 2020/2021) and was not presented during the online visit and meetings with programme director, it was later (on July 28, 2021) confirmed by MAUP representative via additional information request – currently in this PhD programme four students defended their PhD thesis (Ibrahim Hannam, Kanan Ayub, Irina Al-Attuy, Chmyr Yaroslav). Kuzmenko Anna is planning to defend in October 2021. In addition, one more of MAUP students has successfully completed the theoretical studies and will defend his thesis in Zhitomir Politehnics in 2021. Such inconsistency and misunderstanding of information provided (the finalisation and submission of SAR took place likely at the end of 2020 / beginning of 2021 and PhD thesis defences and diploma issues took place in 2020 - Накази про видачу дипломів, https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KeXx-utjgIzbAPpAvU1U1QeYg4Vd9d_B/view, and in April 2021 - Наказ про видачу дипломів 04-21, <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1-8jvCwmZbrEfVzNqHYDMRzz7VVh1xkC9/view>) signal serious risks in information and process management of the study and research process and programme implementation.

The expert group noted the different facts regarding supervisors, for two PhD students, - Chmyr Yaroslav Ihorovich and Ibrahim Suleiman Hannam:

1. supervisor for Chmyr Yaroslav Ihorovich:

- in the document “Councils for the Defence of PhD Dissertations” (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/12nsmCKmokTHpK5TqF_574jWDDDPk9krF/view - p. 5) the supervisor was indicated as “Klimkova Iryna Ihorivna”;
- in the document “Correspondence of scientific interests of graduate students and teachers” (link: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1VX4PGuGC8gARRtKqmjUpH03HMgwYh-2X/edit> - h/ - p. 9) the supervisor was indicated “Balashov A.M.”.

2. supervisor for Ibrahim Suleiman Hannam:

- in the document “Councils for the Defence of PhD Dissertations” (link: https://drive.google.com/file/d/12nsmCKmokTHpK5TqF_574jWDDDPk9krF/view - p. 4) the supervisor was indicated as “Balashov Anatoliy Mykolayovich”;

- in the document “Correspondence of scientific interests of graduate students and teachers” (link: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1VX4PGuGC8gARRtKqmjUpH03HMgwYh-2X/edit-h/> - p. 24) the supervisor was indicated “Parkhomenko-Kutsevil O.I.”.

Such an inconsistency, although might be technical or well justified (e.g. change of supervisor) can still signal serious risks in information and process management of the study and research process and programme implementation.

The Expert group observed that 4 PhD students graduated DStP of Public management and administration in 2020/2021.

There are several mechanisms at the programme for the involvement of employers in the management and development of study programme, which are regulated and organized at both, central MAUP level by The Educational and Research Institute of International Relations and Social Sciences (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1AIOCNCd813Of4HE88U19uw9YtJW9CcdR/view>, SAR p.52), through MAUP Council of Employers (Regulations on the Council of Employers" https://drive.google.com/file/d/1ARIYbd5aklsNCOvpahevwlajgV-5_FF5/view, SAR p.177) as well as at department and programme level (study process, leading-specialists` guest lectures, scientific consultation, committees, department meetings, *holding round tables, open forums, discussion clubs with the administration of the Academy, the Institute and / or with the participation of employers*, SAR p.6 and 7).

It is to be emphasized that employer representatives were involved already in the development of the initial design of the new PhD program in 2018 (SAR, p.54, https://drive.google.com/file/d/1wWoYqQWXIv_k5hGL1CAXL93T5WmZI-Qm/view).

During the expert online visit to MAUP and meeting with the employers on July 5th, 2021, experts received an impression that among the invited employers most cooperation is held with with PhD program and based on the meeting it can be concluded that there is substantial well cooperation of employers with DStP - in addition, it goes quite in line with what director of DStP stated on DStP aim - PhD is very much targeted toward supplementation and support of PA reforms. E.g., Mrs Alla Klocko, President of the Public Organization ReSURS, talks also on further derived cooperation with British Chamber. Overall PhD is seen by employers as a strong program. Employer involvement in the programme is very much seen together with the above-mentioned strategic aim of the programme (supplementation and support of PA reforms in Ukraine) therefore the major labour market (employers) target audience for the programme is state, public and higher education institutions - the state is considered to be an important employer for programme graduates (SAR, p.3).

The purpose of the survey of employers is to improve the content of the educational program, the results of the Institute, to harmonize the results of activities with the requirements of employers, the modern labor market and more (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/opituvannya6.html>). One of the tasks is to use the questionnaire as one of the elements of monitoring the quality control system of the educational process. At the beginning of the second semester of 2020-2021 academic year Educational and methodical institute IAPM conducted a survey of employers / practice managers on the issues satisfaction with the training of future employees. (SAR, p.52.)

The questionnaire for employers is presented on PhD StP SAR p.176-177.

The survey of employers was conducted in January-February 2021. The programme evaluated the feedback from stakeholders as positive and the results of the surveys are posted <https://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/instituti/imvsn/kafedra-publichnogo-administruvannya/phd->

doktor-filosofii-aspirantura/opituvannya15.html. (SAR, p.177). The provided link however leads to the general website of MAUP and not employers' surveys results. The results of the survey is available elsewhere apparently, and the programme has provided link to them - <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1c0ttTmixVJFqEac7hArGoImTtctxmfvr/view> (Результати опитування роботодавців ОНП 281 Публічне управління та адміністрування.DOC) (SAR p.52). SAR p.52 provides well analysed Employers' Survey results and also the veru results are good - 7 out of 8 employers rated the quality and skills of IAPM graduates / graduates who are undergoing internships on a five-point scale of "5". Employers' survey results are also taken into account in the development of the study process - *The list of disciplines to choose is formed in accordance with the decisions of the educational and methodical commissions (EMC) of the departments, the Council of Employers and students' surveys* (SAR, p.32.). It is, however, to be only guessed how the results of employer's survey based on the questions provided in PhD StP SAR p.176-177, can help to set the selective disciplines for the students, meaning, that again the feedback process of using the outcomes of survey results are not entirely structured and clear and could hold the place for potential improvement.

During the expert online visit to MAUP and meeting with the employers, the employers confirmed participation in employer surveys by the programme. The number of participants in the Employers' Survey is comparatively low. Overall, however, the mechanisms of feedback analyses from Employers' Surveys for improvement of the content and quality of study the programme are not well structured and organized.

During the expert online visit to MAUP and meeting with the employers on July 5th, 2021, experts received an impression that among the invited employers most cooperation is held with with PhD program and based on the meeting it can be concluded that there is substantial well cooperation of employers with DStP -in addition, it goes quite in line with what director of DStP stated on DStP aim - PhD is very much targeted toward supplementation and support of PA reforms. E.g. Mrs Alla Klocko, President of the Public Organization ReSURS, talks also on further derived cooperation with British Chamber. Overall PhD is seen by employers as a strong program.

Outcomes of surveys for graduates are rather well analysed by the programme in SAR (see pages 30, 31). The SAR shows that the results of the survey are well, however the very results are not presented, as well as the mechanisms for this feedback analysis is not organized in a targeted manner. This can be partly explained and justified by the so far comparatively low number of PhD graduates (4) with whom the programme has close touch on almost daily basis, including about the aspects of programme's evaluation. In addition, information provided to experts, MAUP's representative stated that graduate survey in May 2021 was not carried out. Surveys are usually carried out in the beginning of each academic year, and thus will take place in September 2021. During this survey also graduates from 2016 would be included (as in that year only one person graduated). Academic staff keeps in touch with the graduates informally and receive a very positive feedback, and no particular suggestions on how to improve this programme were provided during these informal meetings.

In this context again the SAR includes general additional information about MAUP's overall activities in graduate surveys - e.g. *To reflect the satisfaction and interest in learning, the administration of the Institute conducts a semester graduate students' survey to assess the teachers' work and the quality of the educational process. The level of satisfaction is regularly studied through interviews of the head of the Department of Public Administration with graduate students and through anonymous*

questionnaires. The Institute receives feedback from graduate students after questionnaires on the quality of the educational process. (SAR, p.27, 28). Also in September 2020, graduate students were interviewed about their satisfaction with the quality of control measures, the possibility of appealing them and resolving conflict situations at PJSC "IAPM" (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1xXufXKfkmknzk4Js8YtVamG> - link provided inactive) 16 applicants were interviewed. (SAR, p.30). - it shows clear contradiction to the specific PhD programme related performance (provided in additional information) and tends to be misleading and inefficient thus causing risks for misunderstanding, errors and inefficient work and inefficient use of resources in information management and administration needed for the very programme.

Strengths

1. During 2020-2021 4 PhD-students graduated DStP of Public management and administration.
2. Strong cooperation with the employers and their involvement and their positive attitude, recognition for the PhD programme. Very positive and strong feedback and support for the programme from employers.

Weaknesses

1. The number of participants in the Employers` Survey is comparatively low (8).
2. The mechanisms of feedback analyses of the Employers` Survey for improvement of the content and quality of study programme are not clearly structured and organized.
3. No information available on graduates, their workplace (field) and the average pay.
4. Different and inconsistent information about supervisors of PhD students in different documents (e.g. "Councils for the Defence of PhD Dissertations" and "Correspondence of scientific interests of graduate students and teachers"). Such an inconsistency, although might be technical or well justified (e.g. change of supervisor), can still signal serious risks in information and process management of the study and research process and programme implementation.
5. Different and inconsistent information about the number of PhD graduates and e.g. Graduates Survey in different documents (SAR, university orders, additional information provided). Such an inconsistency, although might be technical or well justified (e.g. change of supervisor), can still signal serious risks in information and process management of the study and research process and programme implementation.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

Short-term recommendations:

1. To keep clear track of PhD students' supervisors and co-supervisors, informing also the very students about them.
2. Organize promotional, information spread and other involvement activities to increase the participation rate of employers in the Employers` Survey.
3. Specify the process of feedback analysis from employers - provide the feedback of feedback to employers and graduates; organize targeted department meetings on the feedback preferably together with the targeted meetings for course syllabuses` annual updates.

Long-term recommendations:

1. Improve information management and administration system and process to keep clear track and collect information at one basic place (database, internal system) about the number of graduates and

to use this database or united place of information for the preparation of additional supplement documentation and make references from where the information is extracted.

2. To implement the database with information of PhD graduates.

Assessment: Experts joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **GOOD**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

10. Student services

University provides well-organized support for students in various fields. For the study process or scientific research, students have the possibility to use free-use libraries, information funds, educational, scientific and sports facilities of the MAUP.

Also, the MAUP provides accessible study formats for students with special educational needs. To exercise the right to education of persons with special educational needs in the Academy "Regulations on the organization of the educational process in the Private Joint-Stock Company" Higher Educational Institution "MAUP" (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1euqskSvihgLRxNd8YW_J5N8b7EvfO-ns/view?usp=sharing) the possibility of granting the applicant academic leave or a break in studies with the preservation of certain rights, as well as the resumption of studies in the manner prescribed by the Academy; the participation of the applicant in the formation of an individual curriculum on the basis of medical or other reasons, documented. During the COVID-19 pandemic, MAUP successfully switched to distance learning, providing students with the same quality studies as it was before the pandemic. This information was checked and verified during the meetings with students and academic staff.

For the scientific part, students are being informed about research projects where they can be involved. Also, MAUP scientific conferences are organized by PhD and other program students, which gives the possibility to develop organizational skills and also participate in conferences as a speaker.

Information support for students is based on the main information platform of the MAUP - the official website (<http://maup.com.ua>), where relevant information about the life of the higher education institution is placed: events, events, normative documents, announcements. As information support, the educational process in the MAUP, a software product (Telegram) is used, posted on the official website, which provides online access of applicants to the schedule of classes of all specialties and teachers with the ability to track operational changes. Advisory support for applicants on employment is provided by the Center for the organization of practice, employment of students and work with graduates, deans. As social support, the dean's office and student self-government apply if necessary to receive financial assistance in cases established by law.

The Department of Educational Work and Sports is engaged in educational work, the functions of which are the monitoring of social and communicative issues among students. The Monitoring Commission for the Quality of Higher Education, which was established by the Methodical Council of the Institute, conducts a survey (survey) of applicants in order to determine the assessment of students in providing comprehensive support from the institution of higher education.

The Psychological Service has been working at the Odessa Institute since 2018, headed by Candidate of Psychological Sciences, Associate Professor Repnova TP. Every week she provides psychological consultations to students and teachers, if necessary, in the classroom. 5. The Odessa Institute also has a Legal Clinic, where student counsellors can gain the skills of practical work of a lawyer. (<http://odessa.maup.com.ua/>). The position of student ombudsman is permanent at the MAUP

(<http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/studenska-rada/upovnovazheni-prav-studentiv.html>, which represents students before the administration in resolving conflict situations. The Odessa Institute is currently developing its own Regulations on the Student Ombudsman. The MAUP and the Odessa Institute have "trust boxes" in the open with questions to the Rector of the Academy and the Director of the Institute, in which students (even anonymously) can leave questions or complaints to the administration. This mechanism of interaction between applicants and management has proven effective in being able to respond quickly to conflict situations related to sexual harassment, discrimination and corruption.

Strengths

1. MAUP has made a strong student-oriented infrastructure that allows students to solve different study problems that students can face.
2. During the COVID-19 crisis, the MAUP successfully provided distance learning for PhD students and also helped them to continue previously started research projects.

Weaknesses

1. Students can publish their research in local and MAUP journals free of charge, however, for international journals, there is no defined way how students can get financial support.

Recommendations for elimination of weaknesses and further development

1. For better clarity, there is a need to define the way how students can get financial support for their research (in this document there would be necessary to include information about the application process and also maximal support amount).

Assessment: Experts joint opinion on this assessment criterion is - **EXCELLENT**.

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
X				