

**Expert report**  
**on the assessment of the master study programme**  
**“Law” specialty 081**  
**implemented by branches of the Interregional Academy of**  
**Personal Management (Ukraine) in Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk,**  
**Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi, and Zhytomyr**

**1. Summary**

Master study programme “Law”, specialty 081, implemented in 6 branches of Interregional Academy of Personnel Management (IAPM) situated in Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi, and Zhytomyr in Ukraine is developed in accordance with the laws and regulations of Ukraine, and internal regulations of the IAPM.

Positive aspects include:

- a set of approved IAPM’s regulations on internal system of quality assurance;
- centralized, but in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity, study programme’s management;
- some steps are already done in order to implement the requirements of the new Standard on master studies in Law (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053);
- study programme’s design in accordance with needs of the Ukrainian market for lawyers and close cooperation with the market;
- stakeholders’ awareness about antiplagiarism rules and procedures;
- student-centred approach in teaching and learning, including adaptation to the opportunities of working students to attend the classes;
- financial and logistical resources (classrooms, libraries, dormitories and other infrastructure objects), as well as educational and methodological support of the study program;
- free access to all available resources and infrastructure necessary for studying, teaching and / or research activities within the educational program;
- system of benefits in tuition fees, support mechanisms for research activities of the teaching staff;
- an appropriate level of educational, organizational, informational, advisory, social, career and psychological support for students;
- consideration of opinions of students, permanent position of student ombudsperson;
- high level of satisfaction of students and employers.

Among the negative aspects:

- poor international academic mobility of teaching staff and lack of the international academic mobility of students;
- consideration only of Ukrainian market needs;

- non-compliance of the work programmes of study material/study disciplines to the titles of study courses and learning outcomes, disproportionately large, according to the volume of each study course, list of compulsory literature, as well as lack of foreign literature;
- insufficient usage of MOODLE platform opportunities in the study process;
- insufficient involvement of the academic staff in research activities on an international scale;
- lack of non-formal education events for student youth;
- lack of IAPM's regulations that establish a single procedure for resolving conflict situations.

It is recommended:

- to put the Strategy of IAPM in line with Ukraine's Sustainable Development Goals;
- to adapt the study programme to the needs of international labour market;
- to encourage the development and sustainability of the study programme;
- to specify the rights and duties of a study programme's guarantor in the quality assurance process in IAPM's internal regulations;
- to resolve the issue with interrelation of different study courses and the relation between the aims of study courses and the intended outcomes of study programme;
- to introduce more comparative legal courses or at least comparative legal aspects (themes) of study courses;
- to strengthen interregional cooperation in the study process;
- to shorten the number of mandatory literature sources in order to encourage an appropriate student workload;
- to supplement the study discipline work programmes/syllabi with foreign literature;
- to adapt the work programmes/syllabi of study disciplines according to the titles of the study disciplines and the learning outcomes;
- to update the work study programmes/syllabi with recent changes in the legislation and recent scientific and methodological publications;
- to supplement the range of used literature / the funds of the library with the latest literature, including foreign one;
- to elaborate the annual internationalization Action Plan, which shall include special actions aimed at the internationalization of master studies in Law;
- to intensify the dissemination of the information on the international academic mobility among teaching staff;
- to participate in international academic mobility projects (e.g., Erasmus+);
- to attract the international professors (including via online options) to deliver lectures for students of the study programme;
- to offer some courses within the study programme in foreign language in order to establish the "academic mobility windows" and to attract foreign students;
- to participate in international educational exhibitions in order to broad the international cooperation network;
- to establish a mandatory requirement for academic staff to have a certain number of international involvement activities within a specified period of time;
- to promote a more active and effective usage of the MOODLE platform opportunities, especially in part-time studies, not only posting there the list of literature sources, but also presentations of lectures and various theoretical and practical tasks;
- to pay attention to increasing the level of inclusion of the environment for people with special educational needs, especially to ensure adequate access to the library;
- to increase the number of foreign legal literature and other foreign resources in the library's funds of institutes;

- to include the writing and defence of a master thesis as a compulsory component (compulsory form of attestation) of the master study programme;
- to create the conditions for closer communication between students of different branches of the IAPM;
- to adopt the IAPM's regulation that would stipulate the unified procedure for resolution of conflict situations;
- to arrange more activities for student youth, including training, non-formal education events, interactive events.

## **2. Information about the assessment procedure (timeline, experts group, scope of evaluation)**

The assessment procedure of the master study programme "Law" in the IAPM in Ukraine was carried out from July 20th and site visit took place on 5th and 6th October 2020 via Zoom. The assessment procedure of the master study programme "Law" took place in six branches of the IAPM: Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi, and Zhytomyr.

The assessment was conducted by an international group of experts which included:

- Prof. Jānis Načisčionis (head of the expert group);
- Prof. Yuliya Vashchenko (secretary of the expert group);
- Prof. Jānis Teivāns-Treinovskis;
- Dr.sc.admin. Intra Lūce (representative of employers);
- Svitlana Hrytsai (student member).

The assessment procedure consisted of the following stages:

- analysis of the self-evaluation documentation prepared by IAPM;
- site-visit (in online mode);
- preparation of the expert report.

The assessment was based on the following sources of information:

- standard of higher education of Ukraine of the second (master's) level of higher education of field of knowledge 08 "Law" (speciality 081 "Law");
- report of self-assessment of Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi and Zhytomyr branches;
- document about educational-professional program "Law";
- curricula of educational-professional program "Law";
- annotations of study disciplines;
- information about financial resources of IAPM;
- other additional information about the study process in the IAPM.

The assessment report of the master study programme "Law" was based on ten defined criteria: Criterion 1. Strategy, aims and programme management; Criterion 2. Structure and content of the programme; Criterion 3. Teaching and learning materials; Criterion 4. Techniques and methods of educational activity; Criterion 5. Teaching staff; Criterion 6. Resources; Criterion 7. Research work; Criterion 8. Cooperation and internationalisation; Criterion 9. Employability of graduates; Criterion 10. Student services.

Each criterion is assessed according to the following evaluation scale:

- Excellent – no deficiencies in meeting the set criterion have been identified;
- Good – minor deficiencies in meeting the set criterion have been identified;

- Average – deficiencies have been identified in meeting a criterion, but they can be eliminated within a short period of time;
- Poor – significant deficiencies have been identified, and they cannot be eliminated within a short period of time.

### **3. General description of the IAPM profile**

IAPM is the largest private higher education institution in Ukraine, founded in 1989. Currently, the higher education institution has 29 branches and the study process is ensured in eight study fields: Management and Administration, Law, Civil Security, Social and Behavioural Sciences, Humanities, Information Technologies, Social Work, and Service Sector. The total number of students at the IAPM is more than 16,000, including about 1,000 foreign students, and approximately 1200 students of Law studies. The master study programme “Law” to be accredited is implemented in six branches of the IAPM: Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi, and Zhytomyr. The higher education institution has its own emblem and website – [www.maup.com.ua](http://www.maup.com.ua). Each of the branches, in which the study programme to be accredited is implemented, has publicly available information at the website: in Odessa – <http://odessamaup.pp.ua/>, Kherson – <http://maup.net.ua>, Lutsk – <http://volyn.maup.com.ua>, Kropyvnytskyi – <http://kropivnitsky.maup.com.ua>, Khmelnytskyi – <http://maup.km.ua>, Zhytomyr – <http://maup.zt.ua>. The websites of the IAPM branches provide a sufficiently wide amount of available information, including information about the conducted surveys and a summary of survey results, cooperation agreements, respected cooperation agreements with students’ places of internship, information about the study programme itself and open days, etc.

At the IAPM, the development of self-assessment reports of the study programmes is coordinated and managed by the Center for Educational and Methodological Support and Accreditation.

### **4. Strategy, aims and programme management.**

From the self-assessment report, supplementary documents and information that was provided by IAPM during the meetings with the top management of IAPM, central administration and support staff at IAPM, the study programme directors (guarantors), teaching staff, students, employers from Odessa, Kherson, Khmelnytskyi, Kropyvnytskyi, Lutsk, and Zhytomyr it can be concluded that the master study programme “Law” is developed in accordance with the laws of Ukraine, regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers, Standard of higher education of Ukraine (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053) and internal regulations of the IAPM.

In accordance with the Strategy for the development of the Private Joint-Stock Company Higher Educational Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management” for 2019-2029 approved and put into effect from November 1<sup>th</sup> 2019 education becomes a subject of public life that shapes the future of the country. Modern higher education institutions are responsible for the developing world. That is why the issue of the quality of higher education is of key importance.

In Ukraine, a course has been set for the high-tech direction of further progress. The rate of human capital, which would ensure the innovative development of the state through the interested interaction of higher education, science, business and government, is crucial.

It is stipulated in the abovementioned Strategy, that the new Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” creates modern challenges for higher education institutions in the country. This is a reform of the Free Economic Zone itself, which should have the tools of organizational and financial autonomy. It can be concluded that Strategy has legal grounds; it is in accordance with the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education”, but there is no reference, no link to Ukraine's Sustainable Development Goals for the period until 2030 approved by Decree of the President of Ukraine of 30 September 2019 Nr722/2019.

It should be underlined that the Strategy mentioned above does not include targets (aims) as it is asked by regulations for assessment. At the same time, it should be mentioned that self-assessment reports by IAMP include “the purpose of the master study programme “Law””. The goal of the Master's study program Law 081 must be in line with the goal of the Standard and IAPM Strategy. This will be in accordance with the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education”.

The Strategy contains the following mission of the IAPM:

Together to the peaks of professional excellence and life success of everyone for the prosperity of Ukraine by:

- providing high-quality and socially significant higher education with the use of the latest educational technologies in order to constantly improve the educational and cultural level of the population of Ukraine and other countries;
- mission, self-improvement of research and teaching staff, staff and students in the process of their joint educational, scientific, innovative and organizational activities based on personal vocation and respect for man, changes in the world around us;
- training of professionals of the new generation recognized in Ukraine and abroad - leaders in economics, finance, management, law, international relations, public communications and regional studies, tourism, psychology, social work, foreign philology. medicine, information technology and advertising.

Vision of the IAPM provides:

- creation of a multicultural, entrepreneurial, innovative institution of higher education of leadership type;
- creating an atmosphere of support and development of leadership potential, creative abilities and talents of research and teaching staff, staff and students through their participation in student government, innovative educational, scientific and practical activities, programs of international cooperation and mobility;
- formation of corporate culture and modern management system based on the principles of value leadership and service leadership. It should be emphasized that here and further the “mobility” is not only in “Erasmus+” mobility understanding.

Economic and social grounds for establishing the study programme:

The economic and social grounds for implementing the study programme are that it is oriented toward the labour market of enterprises, institutions and organizations of various forms of ownership, where professional lawyers capable of performing complex legal tasks in different fields of law are needed.

The master study programme “Law” is based on fundamental scientific results, taking into account the contemporary features of legal practice, and is oriented as much as possible at the formation of inter-sectoral knowledge and skills.

Aims of the study programme and their compliance with the strategic directions of the higher education institution:

The absence of a goal (aim, target) in the Strategy for the development of the Private Joint-Stock Company Higher Educational Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management” for 2019-2029 approved and put into effect from November 1<sup>th</sup> 2019 resulted in the absence of an aim in the master study programme “Law”.

The master study programme’s “Law” is not in compliance with the Strategy for the development of the Private Joint-Stock Company Higher Educational Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management”.

There is no definite wording - “aim” or “target” of the master study programme.

In this aspect the master study programme “Law” of IAPM is not harmonized to the Standard on master studies in Law (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053) as well.

The master study programme “Law” allows to get acquainted with complex specialized problems in the field of professional legal activity or in the process of training, which involves the application of legal doctrines, legal principles, rules of law, which provides for conducting research and implementing innovations and is characterized by complexity and uncertainty of conditions.

Structure of the programme’s management, including the involved parties/ individuals and their responsibilities:

At the level of IAMP, the rector is responsible for all activities of IAMP.

Tasks of a project group are determined by the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” and the Licensing Conditions for Conducting Educational Activities of Educational Institutions approved by the CMU Resolution from 30th December 2015 Nr.1187.

The structural unit (sub department) responsible for the implementation of the study programme is: the Department of Legal Disciplines of all six institutes (Zhytomyr, Odessa, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytsky, and Kherson) of the IAPM.

Other educational structural units (departments or other units) involved in the implementation of the study programme are: the Dean’s Office and the Department of General Scientific, Social and Behavioural Disciplines of all (six) Institutes of the IAPM.

There also should be mentioned the guarantor of a study programme. The guarantor of the study programme has a wide range of responsibilities in order to bring the study program to life. According to para. 4.4. of the IAPM’s Regulation of the Internal Higher Education Quality Assurance System the requirements of the activity of the study programme’s guarantor and the project group are stipulated by the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” and the Licensing Conditions for Conducting Educational Activities of Educational Institutions approved by the KMU Resolution from 30th December 2015 Nr.1187. However, these documents do not mention the position of a guarantor. The Licensing conditions stipulate the responsibilities of the project group and its head and cover

only Licensing Requirements. The position of a guarantor was introduced by the Regulation on Accreditation of Study Programmes in Higher Education approved by Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 11.07.2019 Nr 977. According to Chapter 2 (p. 4) of this Regulation the self-assessment report on the study programme shall be prepared by a research and teaching or research staff member – a study programme’s guarantor appointed by the order of the head of the higher education institution responsible for the implementation of such study programme. In case of absence of the order a head of the respective project group approved by the higher education institution according to the Licensing Conditions for Conducting Educational Activities shall be considered as a study programme’s guarantor. A study programme’s guarantor, together with a head of the higher education institution, is defined as a contact person in accreditation relations from the side of the educational institution according to the Regulation on the Accreditation of Study Programmes in Higher Education mentioned above. The concrete rights and obligations of the study programmes guarantors in the quality assurance process shall be defined by the higher education institutions. Therefore, it is suggested to define them in detail in the IAPM’s Regulation of the Internal Higher Education Quality Assurance System or in the separate Regulation on a study programme’s guarantor.

#### Structure for student participation in the programme management:

During the evaluation of the study programme from materials provided there were found general terms and conditions for student’s participation in the study programme “Law” as follows:

1. Participation in the work of the Scientific Council of the Institute (as a part of the Scientific-Methodical Council), monitoring of the quality of normative documents (study programmes, working programs of academic disciplines, methodical support of the educational process, etc.).
2. Participation in the work of the student organization of self-government of the Institute.
3. Participation in the work of academic groups, initiative groups or individually.

That is good for the master’s programme “Law” to be developed and be sustainable.

The study and analysis of proposals of applicants for higher education on the content of study programs and improving the quality of higher education is as follows:

1. Survey, representative survey, questionnaire to ensure publicity and transparency.
2. Holding round tables, open forums, discussion clubs with the administration of the IAPM, the Institute and / or with the participation of employers, etc.

An attractive feature for students is an active social life.

The renewal of the second (master's) level of higher education took place with the direct participation of stakeholders of both students and employers.

The updated version of the master study programme "Law" took into account the results of a survey of full-time and part-time master students on the quality of education and the quality of the master study programme "Law". In total, 10 students were surveyed on the quality of the study programme under evaluation.

For example, the study programme mentioned above was presented for the discussion to the Student Council of the Institute. The results of the discussion, suggestions and comments of students are reflected in Protocol No 4 of the Student Council of the Kherson Institute of IAPM. All students agreed on the need to radically update the study program in order to bring it closer to the realities of

the modern labour market in the region. At the same time, they noted the effectiveness of this study program in their industry niche. Almost the same information about students' participation in the programme management was explored in Khmelnytsky Institute of IAPM.

System and procedures for admission of students, including the mechanisms for the recognition of prior learning:

IAPM creates counselling centers at the admissions committees to assist entrants in submitting applications in electronic format. Applicants can apply to such consulting centers of any institution of higher education in order to create an electronic cabinet, submit an application in electronic form, and certificate.

Admission to the IAPM for all levels of higher education is conducted on the basis of competition.

For competitive selection of persons entering for a master studies, on the basis of a bachelor, master degree (educational qualification level of a specialist) on the master study programme "Law" for obtaining master degree are taken into account:

- the results of a unified entrance exam in a foreign language in the form of a test in a foreign language (English, German, French or Spanish);
- the results of a unified professional entrance examination in Law and general educational legal competencies, part of which is the test in law and a test of general educational legal competence.

To obtain a master degree, the minimum score in competitive subjects, entrance examinations, and professional examinations is not less than 100.

This system seems sustainable, it allows the selection of the best candidates for studies in the master programme in Law. The selection system for entering the IAPM is also to be supported in the future.

System for internal monitoring, development and review of the study programme, including the system for receiving and using the feedback of stakeholders, the use of key-performance indicators:

The internal quality assurance framework at the IAPM operates at three levels:

- at the IAPM level;
- at the level of institutes/faculties;
- at the level of departments.

It ensures coordination between those involved in the study process and promotes opportunities for improving the quality of the study process.

The Center for Educational and Methodological Support and Accreditation is directly responsible for ensuring the monitoring and operation of the internal quality system at IAPM; it interacts with the following structures: directorates, administrations of institutes, dean's offices of departments, sub-departments on organization of educational activity, monitoring of the quality of higher education; at the Kherson( the same is said about Odessa) Institute Deputy Director of the Institute is responsible for the quality of the study program.

The Board for Organization of the Educational is responsible for the receiving information on the number of graduates of IAPM by specialty; monitoring the functioning of information systems for managing the study process at IAPM, including obtaining: information for determining qualitative



and absolute indicators of the higher education students' academic performance; information on the higher education students' ranking of knowledge based on the results of the examination and test session per academic year.

The Center for Organization of Scientific Work and Innovation in the Educational Process is responsible for the organizing and conducting research in the field of higher education.

The Department of Distance Education is responsible for the organization and normative support of the educational process in distance learning, use of distance technologies in the educational process, development and certification of distance courses of educational disciplines, conduct of the Principal's control of the higher education students' knowledge by means of educational content management systems.

The Department of Licensing is responsible for submitting documents to the Unified State Electronic Database on Education (USEDE) to ensure the implementation of electronic licensing (the structure of IAPM, logistics, staffing support, licenses, accreditation certificates, etc.).

The Department for Ensuring the Work of the Admissions Committee and the Processing of Documents on Education is responsible for the exchanging information between the information system of management of the study process and the USEDE; the enrolling and expelling students, admissions, production of duplicate official transcripts, issuing higher education documents; on timely submitting the information on the movement of the student contingent, forming orders for the issuance of state recognized student cards and documents on education; on extending the functionality and improving the functioning of the USEDE program modules; receiving information about the results of admission to IAPM.

The International Open University is responsible for implementing international cooperation in the field of quality assurance in higher education.

The Center for Organization of Student Practice and Employment and for Work with Graduates is responsible for the involving enterprises and organizations of different fields of economy, industry associations, etc. in organizing and conducting class exercises and all types of practice of knowledge of the higher education students, promoting the employment of graduates, training and advanced training of scientific-pedagogical (pedagogical) employees.

The Institute of the Development of Scientific Personnel and Business Education is responsible for obtaining the information on training and advanced training of scientific-pedagogical staff.

The Department of Staffing Support and Labour Economics is responsible for the forming the staffing list, material incentives for the staff; obtaining information on the staffing support of the educational process; providing conclusions on the compliance of the staffing support with the regulatory requirements, information on the ranking of educational and scientific institutes, departments by the indicators of the staffing support of the study process; on issuing orders and transferring individuals' record files.

Yaroslav the Wise International Library and Information Center is responsible for providing educational and methodological literature.

Student self-government bodies are responsible for organizing and analyzing the results of student monitoring of the study process and implementing proposals formed based on its results.

**Strengths:**

1. the study programme provides uniform requirements for lawyers throughout the country;
2. centralized, but in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity, programme’s management;
3. the study programme is designed to meet the needs of the Ukrainian market for lawyers.

**Weaknesses:**

1. the study programme is designed to meet the needs for lawyers only of the Ukrainian market.

**Recommendations:**

1. to adapt the study programme to the needs of the international labour market;
2. to encourage the development and sustainability of the study programme;
3. to put the Strategy of IAPM in line with Ukraine's Sustainable Development Goals;
4. to specify the rights and duties of a study programme’s guarantor in the quality assurance process in the IAPM’s internal regulations in detail.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**5. Structure and content of the programme**

From the self-assessment materials and information that was given during on-site meetings with the top management of IAPM, central administration and support staff of IAPM, the study programme directors (guarantors), teaching staff, students, employers from Odessa, Kherson, Khmelnytskyi, Kropyvnytskyi, Lutsk, and Zhytomyr it can be concluded that master study programme “Law” is developed almost in accordance with the Laws of Ukraine, regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers, standards and internal regulations of the IAPM.

Standard of higher education of Ukraine (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053) prescribes the following:

- The volume of educational-professional programme is 90 ECTS;
- At least 50% of the volume of the study programme should be oriented to ensuring the learning outcomes in the specialty 081 “Law” is determined by this Standard.
- For the educational-professional programme, a minimum of 30 ECTS credits is provided for undergoing practical training.

Current description of the study programme was approved by the Academic Council of the IAPM on 25.09.2019 (minute Nr 9), before the new Standard of higher education of Ukraine (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053) was adopted.

The working programmes under evaluation implemented in the 6 branches are based on this study programme’s description.

The IAPM has already elaborated the draft description of the master study programme in Law that is based on the new Standard of higher education of Ukraine (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053). The drafts are presented on the official web pages of the branches for public consideration. The draft description stipulates 30 ECTS for practice. It should be emphasized that during on-site meetings the representatives of the employers welcomed the increased number of ECTS credits for practice.

The relevance of the content of the study programme and compliance with the needs of labour market:  
The content of the master study programme “Law” should be designed according to the Standard (STANDARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION OF UKRAINE master studies 08 Law 081 Law).

But, from the self-assessment materials and information that was given during meetings with employers from Odessa, Kherson, Khmelnytskyi, Kropyvnytskyi, Lutsk, and Zhytomyr it can be concluded that employers need well-trained lawyers. There was no emphasis on some specific specialists - prosecutors, judges, lawyers (advocates), specialists for labour in regional administration. The general emphasis from employers was on graduates as general lawyers.

That means, employers know that they can expect graduates as lawyers without any specialization as an outcome of the study process. Specialization seems to take place only during the internship.

The new master study programme in Law requires closer cooperation between the IAPM and the industry in order to prepare industry-specific specialists in law.

Careful observation of the meeting of the President of Ukraine V. Zelensky with the Prime Minister of the United Kingdom B. Johnson, reveals that the establishment of bilateral trade relations is marked. Maybe it is worthwhile for the IAPM to think about preparing lawyers for the international market to serve international organizations, companies? See: PM meeting with President Zelensky: 8 October 2020. Prime Minister Boris Johnson met Ukrainian President Volodymyr Zelensky in Downing Street this morning. Retrieved 12.10.2020 from: <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/pm-meeting-with-president-zelenskyy-8-october-2020>

Interrelation of different study courses, the relation between the aims of study courses and the intended outcomes of study programme:

The purpose of the master study programme “Law” is to provide academic training of highly qualified legal professionals who are able to solve complex theoretical and practical problems in the sphere of professional activity in the field of law, to carry out scientific and project research and/or carry out scientific-pedagogical activities focused on further professional self-education.

From the self-assessment materials and information that was given during meetings with teaching staff, students, employers from Odessa, Kherson, Khmelnytskyi, Kropyvnytskyi, Lutsk, and Zhytomyr it can be concluded that the master study programme “Law” is developed almost in accordance with the laws of Ukraine, regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers, Standard and internal regulations of the IAPM.

But there was no written or oral evidence about meetings in Departments of Institutes devoted to the question of interrelation of different study courses and the relation between the aims of study courses, and the intended outcomes of study programmes.

It should be mentioned that self-assessment reports (Annex 1) of all institutes contain the table ‘Relationship of different study components (study disciplines)’. That gives slight insight about relationship competencies to be acquired, and relationships between some study disciplines, for instance, a study disciplines “Topical issues of intellectual property” and “Methodology of scientific research and academic integrity” and “Topical issues of civil law”.

It was stated that academicians give so-called “open lectures”, and then there is a discussion at the department on the subject, topicalities, case studies mentioned during the lecture and materials added. During the meetings representatives of the teaching staff spoke about the individual work of academicians and students. It was mentioned that there is close cooperation between academicians and students to conduct the students' learning and their involvement in research work.

The aims of study courses:

Judging the self-assessment materials, it can be found the purpose of studying the academic discipline. For instance, the purpose of studying the academic discipline “Topical Issues of Civil Law” is the formation of a system of scientific, theoretical and practical knowledge on the issues of private law, definition and disclosure of the main problems, interpretation of concepts, categories and institutions, directions of development and improvement of civil legislation in a market economy and the rule of law, as well as helping students to apply in practice the theoretical knowledge gained, solve applied problems and gain experience in drafting legal documents. Discipline status: selective training discipline. The discipline refers to the selective discipline of professional training for the degree of

higher education "Master", for the direction: 08 "Law"; specialty: 081 "Law". However, there is no definite wording that the purpose of this study discipline is in connection with the aim of the Standard.

It should be mentioned that the Odessa's study programme's description is dated 30.08.2019. The work programme for the study discipline "Topical issues of Civil Law" is dated 27.01.2020. The Kherson's study programme is dated 30.08.2019; applied for the academic year 2019-2020. Curriculum for the educational and professional program "Law" dated 2019. That means – before 17.08.2020 when the Standard was approved.

Expected learning outcomes for the discipline "Topical Issues of Civil Law" also are not updated.

During the meeting with academicians informed that they will update the study programme's description, as well as work programmes for the study disciplines till the middle of December 2020.

Following the request of the experts IAPM provided the up-to-date programme descriptions (received 20.10.2020), but for instance, the Volynskij institute still presented the work programme "Topical issues of Intellectual Property" approved on 26.08.2019.

#### The relation between the study courses and internship:

In the self-assessment materials and during meetings it was found that the individual educational trajectory of the student is formed considering the student's abilities, interests, needs, motivation, possibilities and experience; it is based on the student's choice of the study programmes of the relevant specialty, study disciplines, methods of learning. The possibility of choosing subjects is implemented in the optional units of general and professional training cycles. When developing curricula, the formation of the optional component is carried out in accordance with the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" (at least 25% of the total number of ECTS credits).

The students of the study programme "Law" have the opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory also through the choice of the place of practice, the possibility of crediting points of non-formal education. The formation of an individual educational trajectory occurs at the time of entry when students receive a general explanation of the concept of an individual educational trajectory itself in the "Student's Guide."

#### The topics of graduate qualification works:

Self-assessment materials show that the topics of the graduation thesis are suggested in all institutes. For instance, Odessa Institute of Private Joint Stock Company "Higher Education Institution "Interregional Academy of Personnel Management" offers 65 topics, Kherson Institute of Private Joint Stock Company "Higher Education Institution "Interregional Academy of Personnel Management." - 65 topics. It should be noticed that the topics are very similar in both Institutes that constitute a risk for the fulfilment of the principle of academic integrity.

In Khmelnytsky Institute of Private Joint Stock Company "Higher Education Institution "Interregional Academy of Personnel Management" topics of graduation work are divided by branches of law: Administrative, Financial and Banking Law - 40 topics, Commercial, Labour, Civil Law - 89 topics, International Law and Comparative Law -12 topics, Law Enforcement and Anti-corruption Activities -55 topics. In comparison with previous Institutes, the students of Khmelnytsky branch have a wider choice of topics of a graduation work. In general, suggested topics are closer to the lawyers' competences described in the Standard.

Zhytomyr Institute of Private Joint Stock Company “Higher Education Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management” offers 65 topics of graduation work.

Lutsk Vyacheslav Lypynsky Volyn Institute of Private Joint Stock Company “Higher Education Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management” offers 100 topics of graduation work.

Kropyvnytsky Institute of Private Joint Stock Company “Higher Education Institution “Interregional Academy of Personnel Management” has 71 topics of graduation work.

The topics of the master's thesis are mainly in criminal law, public law, private law, but the topics are not indicated, trends in research in the context of European Union law.

**General conclusions are:**

1. If there are similar topics in the branches, then there are risks for plagiarism.
2. It is visible that the topics of the master's thesis are mainly in criminal law, public law, private law, but the topics are not indicated, trends in research in the context of European Union law.

**Strengths:**

1. The IAPM is already in the process of updating the study programme according to the new Standard.

**Weaknesses:**

1. master theses topics are mainly oriented only to Ukrainian legislation and practice;
2. the risk of plagiarism follows from the similar themes of master theses in branches of IAPM;

**Recommendations:**

1. to resolve the issue with interrelation of different study courses and the relation between the aims of study courses, and the intended outcomes of study programme;
2. to introduce more comparative legal courses or at least comparative legal aspects (themes) of study courses;
3. to coordinate the goals of the study courses and the expected results ;
4. to strengthen interregional cooperation and cooperation between IAPM and industry in the study process;
5. annually update programmes/syllabi in order to meet the requirement of the new Standard on master studies in Law (Approved by Order of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of 17.08.2020.Nr.1053).

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**6. Teaching and learning materials**

IAPM has developed procedures for organising the study process (Organisation of the Educational Process at PJSC HEI IAPM) and developed and updated the teaching materials (Process of Development and Updating of Learning Materials). The updating of teaching materials is scheduled for March of each current year and is approved by the Director of the Educational and Methodological Institute. As can be seen from the descriptions of study disciplines developed and approved by all branches (Odessa, Kherson, Lutsk, Kropyvnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi, and Zhytomyr), they are approved not by the Director of the Educational and Methodological Institute, but by the director of the study programme and the head of a respective department.

The requirements for the development of study disciplines determine the contents that must be reflected in each description of the study discipline, i.e., the aims, volume, planning, examination forms, used literature, etc. of the study course. All existing study materials/study course descriptions of study programmes are methodologically developed in accordance with the set requirements; they have the same form and the content in all branches and, as noted above, have been approved by the same persons. New study materials/study discipline descriptions have been approved by the director of the educational unit and the head of the department in 2019 and 2020. Within the study programme, according to each study discipline, the study discipline goals to be achieved (learning outcomes) are determined (matrix for providing programme learning outcome). Getting acquainted with the study material of each study discipline in more detail, it should be noted that their content only partially reflects the information in order to achieve the planned goals of the study discipline and compliance with the title of the study discipline. The titles of the study disciplines include the words “actual problems”, “modern problems”, “current issues”; however, they are minimally or not at all reflected in the study materials themselves. When indicating the suggested literature in the study materials, it is sometimes indicated in a disproportionate number, it is doubtful whether the student is able to read, get acquainted with more than sixty sources of compulsory literature and sometimes more than a hundred sources of recommended literature.

For example, in the study discipline “Topic Issues of Civil Law” (Odessa), the total number of suggested literature sources – 283, in “Philosophy of Law” compulsory literature accounts for 50 items, the recommended sources – 30, in “Methodology and Organisation of Legal Research” compulsory literature – 20, recommended sources – 57, in “Modern Problems of Administrative Law and Process” compulsory literature – 61, recommended sources – 220, etc.

Taking into account that the study programme under assessment is a Master level study programme, the study materials should also include the literature developed abroad; practically no study material/study discipline description reflects it. During the discussion with the representatives of the academic staff, several indicated (especially emphasised in Kherson) that within the study courses, students are recommended to read (naming specific) foreign literature sources.

Despite the fact, that the work study programmes for study disciplines were approved in 2019-2020, they include out of date legislative acts or do not include the recent changes in the legislation (e.g., the work programme for study discipline “Modern Problems of Financial Law includes the Law of Ukraine on Settlements in International Currency is out of date since 2018; the work programme for the study discipline “Methodology and organization of legal research” does not include the Law of Education of 2017 which stipulates significant requirements on the implementation of the academic integrity principles), do not include recent publications in the subject (e.g., the latest textbook used in the work programme for the study discipline “Modern Problems of Administrative Law and Process” was published in 2012).

There is a special IAPM's Regulation on the development of study disciplines syllabi presented on the IAPM's web page, however there is no data on its approval (if any) ([https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KFEvCu\\_NFhNTEFP-cfaxZiKXNEbGF-O0/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KFEvCu_NFhNTEFP-cfaxZiKXNEbGF-O0/view)) During the onsite visit the teaching staff mentioned that they are in the process of development of the new syllabi for the study disciplines within the study programme under evaluation. The syllabi are constructed mostly for students, whereas work programmes - for teachers. Provided syllabi need to be improved with the consideration of the abovementioned remarks to the work programmes (regarding the list of literature, the use foreign literature, up-to-date legislation and the recent developments in research and teaching literature).

It is also possible for students to use the IAPM library, including the electronic one, within the study process. The total fund of the library is 357,220,000 units, as well as 80 different editions are subscribed for the needs of students, although the areas of law are not separated here. Getting acquainted with the available resources in the electronic library, it should be noted that most of the available sources are for the period up to 2006; only a small part of the available sources can be considered as the latest literature. Thus, a large part of the literature can be used as a historical aspect in the study process. During the discussion, the students also expressed a wish that more information on jurisprudence would be available in the library, including foreign literature, as well as the latest available information technologies.

Within the study programme, an internal normative base has been developed in relation to students' internship, the development of study papers and Master Theses. The independent work of students is regulated by the "Regulation on Student's Independent Work", in which the basic principles of independent work, as well as the types and procedures of tutorial are regulated in detail. The development of a study paper is regulated in a separate regulation "Guidelines for Writing Test", which sets out in detail the requirements for the development of the paper. It should be noted here that the Regulation states that the paper is evaluated according to a five-point scale; however, other documents regulating the study process reflect the evaluation system from 1 to 100 points. The requirements for the development of a Master Thesis are also prescribed separately in "Guidelines for Writing a Diploma (Master Research) Paper". During the discussion with employers (in Kherson), it was noted that they proposed themes for a Master Thesis, i.e., offering the IAPM to include specific themes in the list of recommended themes for a Master Thesis that were relevant at that moment.

It is highly appreciated that the study course "Methodology and Organisation of Legal Research" is included in the study programme. As already mentioned in the self-assessment reports, students in the first semester have two important study courses "Basics of the Profession" and "Organisation of Independent Work of Students".

**Strengths:**

1. well-developed internal normative regulation in relation to the organisation of the study process, including the development of descriptions of study materials/study disciplines, development of study papers and master theses, as well as in relation to internship.

**Weaknesses:**

1. non-compliance of the descriptions of study material/study disciplines to the titles of study courses and learning outcomes;



2. disproportionately large, according to the volume of each study course, list of compulsory literature, as well as suggested sources of the foreign literature are lacking;
3. work programmes/syllabi of the study disciplines need to be updated with consideration of changes in the legislation and recent scientific and methodological publications.

**Recommendations:**

1. to shorten the number of mandatory literature sources in order to encourage an appropriate student workload; if a lecturer nevertheless considers that a large number of sources are to be used and all of them are important, then it is necessary to specify the specific chapters and page range;
2. to supplement the study course materials/study discipline descriptions with the sources of foreign literature;
3. to adapt the work programmes of study disciplines according to the titles of the study disciplines and the learning outcomes;
4. to supplement the range of used literature / the funds of the library with the latest literature, including foreign one.
5. to update the work study programmes/syllabi with recent changes in the legislation and scientific and methodological publications.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**7. Techniques and methods of educational activity**

Requirements on techniques and methods of educational activity are regulated by a set of internal regulations, e.g.:

Regulations on Organization of the Educational Process at PJSC “HEI “IAPM” ([https://drive.google.com/file/d/1euqskSvihgIRxNd8YW\\_J5N8b7EvfO-ns/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1euqskSvihgIRxNd8YW_J5N8b7EvfO-ns/view))

Regulations on Internal Quality Assurance System for Higher Education at PJSC "HEI IAPM" (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1-vhNhXtjgJ2khQxpSUXkhO2Dx5fpiSq/view>)

Regulations for the Assessment of Academic Performance of Higher Education Students at PJSC “HEI “IAPM” (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1ENRncPY-dU2qLke7awVKn1OdfG88Hg8D/view>).

Procedures on encouragement of the academic integrity principle are regulated by:

Academic Integrity Code: ([https://drive.google.com/file/d/1r74\\_4CHxDx1bpAvw8X4AvaqLSGWbyaYd/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1r74_4CHxDx1bpAvw8X4AvaqLSGWbyaYd/view))

Regulations on the Prevention and Detection of Plagiarism in Scientific and Academic Texts: (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1Mj5N2nBwssIworXaa6bx5sO6fjcuH8nJ/view>)

Methodological Recommendations on preparation of diploma (master) work (rules for writing and preparation for the defense) [https://drive.google.com/file/d/1FJD\\_YPmpOMSrXZsdxR03MTq0VQrttDqY/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1FJD_YPmpOMSrXZsdxR03MTq0VQrttDqY/view)

Analysis of the regulation mentioned above, working programmes for study disciplines, as well as meetings with the teaching staff and the students demonstrate that in general modern teaching and learning methods are used by the teaching staff. The students are excited about presentations, case studies, debates offered by the teaching staff. Both teachers and students are familiar with

antiplagiarism rules and detection procedures (including usage of special software, e.g., Unicheck.com). Students also welcome the introduction of the special study discipline in Research Methodology.

The student-centred approach is implemented in the study process. The students are provided with the opportunity to form their individual study trajectory. During the meetings students confirmed that they were provided with the list of elective study disciplines and they chose the study disciplines that better met their expectations. The selection procedure is regulated by Regulations on the Procedure for the Exercise by the Students of PJSC “HEI “IAPM” of the Right to Free Choice of Academic Disciplines (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1umj7v5JKujDpuNCpsyLnSioMruQgkDbs/view>). The students also informed that the institution regularly conducts the survey on their satisfaction of the study programme and considers their interests. In particular, students from Kherson branch mentioned that they suggested including the study discipline in Migration Law and it was implemented. The students’ independent work is arranged according to the Regulation on organization of students’ independent work approved by Order of the Rector of 01 September 2019 No114/1-0 (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UT44La00p84KFqaEOUdV3eemDCnk1UhZ/view> )

Concerning the students’ progress assessment methods, the students mentioned that exams and pass-fail examinations are used. The oral form of the examination was mentioned as the main one.

There is a special IAPM’s Regulation on assessment criteria of students’ knowledge and skills approved by the Senate on 27 April 2019 (<http://maup.com.ua/assets/files/pdf/ocin-znan-stud.pdf> ). Concrete assessment criteria are included in the syllabi.

All stakeholders, namely students, teaching staff, and the employers expressed their worries about the absence of master thesis in the new Master studies (Law) standard as a form of final attestation.

The IAPM’s is in the process of implementation of the E-learning approach for the students of the study programmes under evaluation. As it was mentioned in Self-evaluation materials (e.g., provided by Kherson branch) the graduating department does not have its own systematic distance learning e-learning course so far, while active work is underway to create it. Learning resources in electronic form are available. Lecturers and students prepare presentations, use electronic platforms. In order to encourage the online study process due to COVID-19 restrictions a set of video lectures was recorded by the teaching staff.

There is a lack of the international mobility of students within the study programme at all branches. Partially it is because of the fact that the majority of students combine their studies with a job, partially – because of the lack of the information on international academic mobility opportunities provided by the IAPM.

### **Strengths**

1. necessary procedures on teaching and learning methods, as well as on academic integrity are in place;
2. all stakeholders are familiar with antiplagiarism rules and procedures.

### **Weaknesses**

1. lack of outgoing and incoming student academic mobility.

**Recommendations:**

1. to intensify the dissemination of the information on the international academic mobility among students;
2. to broaden the network of foreign partners, in particular, in order to provide additional opportunities for international academic mobility for students and staff.
3. to participate in international academic mobility projects (e.g., Erasmus+);
4. to promote the participation of students in international projects and events (e.g., conferences, summer/winter schools, moot courts etc.);
5. to stipulate the mandatory written part of the examination in order to strengthen impartiality of assessment;
6. to include a master thesis as one of final attestation forms. The standard stipulates the minimum requirements, however, does not prohibit the use of additional requirements by the higher education institutions. The efficiency of usage of master thesis is confirmed by the positive international experience.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**8. Teaching staff**

The procedure for attracting the academic staff to the study process and the evaluation of their work is approved by “Regulations on the Election and Employment of Research and Teaching Staff”, “Regulations for the Selection and Recruitment of Scientific-Pedagogical Workers”, “Regulation on the Conclusion of Contract when Recruiting Scientific-Pedagogical and Pedagogical Workers”, “Regulations on the Rating of Scientific-Pedagogical Workers, Sub departments, Institutes”, and “Methods for Rating the Activities of a Sub department/Department/Institute/Scientific-Pedagogical Workers”. The regulation “Methods for Rating the Activities of a Sub department/Department/Institute/Scientific-Pedagogical Workers” sets the criteria according to which the activities of each department, institute, scientific-pedagogical employees of the higher education institution are performed. For example, evaluating the participation of academic staff in scientific and practical conferences, both in Ukraine and abroad; the number of publications and source of publication, including SCOPUS, Web of Science, Copernicus; the number of published scientific monographs, doctoral theses; developed teaching materials, etc. On 22 September 2015, the

Rector of the IAMP issued an Order on the procedure for concluding an employment contract, its compliance with the requirements of the Law “On Higher Education” and the standard form of the contract. The vacancy for the academic staff is announced both in the public space and internally – at the website of the IAMP.

When hiring a lecturer, in accordance with the above-mentioned regulations, the higher education institution, in addition to the formal requirements, may request an applicant to hold an open lecture, practical class or seminar in order to assess the level of professional qualification of the applicant. For an academic staff member who repeatedly applies for a vacancy, the results of the student survey and

participation in the quality assurance processes of higher education are taken into account during the evaluation. Regarding the requirements for academic staff, common guidelines were adopted in the country (on 30 December 2015), i.e., “Personnel Requirements for Ensuring the Implementation of Educational Activities in the Field of Higher Education”.

Competent and professional academic staff is involved in the study process, as reflected in the discussion with the representatives of the academic staff, then a large part of them are actually practicing in the field of jurisprudence, for example, working at court. A great part of academic staff has worked or continues to work in the law enforcement establishments (in the establishments of Home affairs system, in the court forensic science, probation service, etc.).

During the meetings with the academic staff it was found out that the teaching staff are provided with an opportunity to improve their teaching skills, in particular, via training organized by the IAPM. Academic staff partly participates in seminars, discussions, conferences, etc. organized by the university and outside.

In addition to pedagogical and methodological activities, the academic staff also carries out research activities. With regard to the research activity of the academic staff, it is mostly done locally, with insufficient participation and publication abroad (in this respect, the scientific activity of the academic staff in Kherson is to be welcomed).

The workload of the academic staff is differentiated according to the academic title and position, qualification level, work experience, participation in methodological, research and other types of activities. According to full-time positions, for example, the workload of a professor is divided as follows: academic work – 30–35%, methodological work – 20–25%, research activities – 30–50% and organizational, educational work – 15–20%. In their turn, lecturers have a higher volume of determined academic and tutorial work, and a lower volume of scientific and organisational work.

Academic staff has the opportunity, which is also partly used, to engage in academic mobility both within Ukraine and abroad. Academic staff are invited to conduct lectures in other higher education institutions in Ukraine. Within the framework of academic mobility, cooperation has been established with universities in Poland and Bulgaria. The procedure for organising academic mobility is stipulated both by the internal regulatory enactment of the higher education institution and the regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers issued at the national level (“On approval of the Regulation on the Procedure for Exercising the Right to Academic Mobility”).

Study discipline work programmes by academic staff are quite extensive. Getting acquainted with them, students can obtain a thorough view of the discipline’s content. It’s worth mentioning the relationships between academic staff and students. Academic staff are working in quite a flexible way, both ensuring the high level of studies and adapting to students’ opportunities to attend the classes at a specific time. To a certain extent it is connected to the fact that the great part of them is part-time students. The academic staff both are carrying on face-to-face lectures in the classrooms and using electronic platforms (such as ZOOM). The use of MOODLE platform could be extensively increased, which would better facilitate the communication between the academic staff and part-time students, here only one study material is available for each study course.

The academic staff also cooperates with each other within the study programme, including reviewing the study content of the study disciplines. For instance, it is important that the content and

requirements of the same study course do not differ significantly. The academic staff is also attracted to deliver lectures in other IAPM's branches which also supports the cooperation between the teaching staff.

**Strengths:**

1. an internal normative base has been developed, observing the established state requirements for academic staff, including recruitment and selection criteria, involvement in the study process, academic, methodological, research activities, etc.;
2. a very flexible organisation of the study process, adapting it to the opportunities of working students to attend the classes;
3. a democratic learning environment and ensuring the priority of students' interests in the study process.

**Weaknesses:**

1. insufficient involvement of the academic staff in research activities on an international scale;
2. insufficient usage of MOODLE platform opportunities in the study process organisation, which would be especially effective to ensure the study process for part-time students.

**Recommendations:**

1. given that the study programme to be accredited is a Master level study programme, the higher education institution should continue to motivate academic staff to engage in research activities, paying special attention to international research activities (publications, conferences), such as making it a mandatory requirement for academic staff to have a certain number of international involvement activities within a specified period of time;
2. it is necessary to promote a more active and effective usage of the MOODLE platform opportunities, especially in part-time studies, not only posting there the list of literature sources, but also presentations of lectures and various theoretical and practical tasks.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**9. Cooperation and internationalization**

The internationalization strategy is emphasized in the internal regulations of the IAPM. The encouragement of the leadership in the field of internationalization of a study process, development of study programmes with English as a language of instructions, study programmes taught in other foreign languages, establishment of double and joint degree programmes, encouragement of international academic mobility, as well as enlargement of the bases of internship in other countries are among priority tasks according to the Strategy of the IAPM approved by the Senate on 10 October 2019 (minute 10) (<http://maup.com.ua/assets/files/publ-adm/strategiya-rozvitku-maup.pdf>).

Encouragement of academic mobility and development of international links and strategic partnership are among key directions as referred to in the Regulation on internal quality assurance system

approved by the Senate on 25 September 2019 (minute 8) (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/sistema-yakosti/struktura-sistemi.html> ).

According to the information presented at the IAPM's web page Law is defined among key directions of international cooperation in research. Participation in programmes of bilateral and multilateral interstate and interinstitutional academic mobility, joint research projects, academic mobility of research, teaching staff and students, joint research events, joint study and research programmes, teaching the international students are among core directions of the international cooperation according to the Internationalization strategy of the IAPM (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/mizhnarodna-osvita/mizhnarodnij-vidkritij-universitet1.html>).

The cooperation agreements with certain foreign higher education institutions have been concluded in recent years: WSWB (Lodz, Poland) in 2019, Warsaw Management University "Collegium Humanum" (Warsaw, Poland) in 2018, Burgas Free University (Burgas, Bulgaria) in 2019. The agreements provide, in particular, opportunities for mutual academic mobility.

International mobility of the teaching staff involved in the study process within the master study programme "Law" needs to be intensified. Only several professors have participated in the international training programmes (e.g., 2 teaching staff representatives in Odessa branch participated in programmes offered by the European University Viadrina (Frankfurt, Germany), Central European Education Institute (Bratislava, Slovakia), 1 professor from Lutsk branch - in the programme in Lodz (Poland)).

The lack of knowledge on programmes of international academic mobility, in particular, the Erasmus + opportunities, of both students and teaching staff was identified during the on-site visit. The representatives of the teaching staff expressed the opinion that the international academic mobility for Law professors and students is limited due to the national character of this field of studies. There is a lack of incoming mobility of students and academic staff. It should be stressed that during the meetings the students expressed their interest in lectures of visiting professors from abroad.

The procedure for organising academic mobility is stipulated both by the internal regulatory enactment of the higher education institution and the regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers issued at the national level ("On approval of the Regulation on the Procedure for Exercising the Right to Academic Mobility"). According to the IAPM's Regulation on Organization of the study process the academic mobility is organized in accordance with the IAPM's Regulation on academic mobility approved on 29.12.2016 Nr 99-p. (<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1xbY3tAcAgu7MXJKaw3ioOE50X0eMbqOj/view>)

There are cooperation agreements concluded by related branches of the IAPM with a number of institutions in Ukraine – public institutions and private entities and professionals in the field. In particular, Kropyvnytskyi branch – with Kirovograd scientific and research expert and criminalistics centre of Ministry of internal affairs of Ukraine, Southern-Eastern interregional department of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine in Kirovograd region, Kirovograd district court, etc.; Kherson branch – with the Main Department of the National Police in Kherson region, Southern Interregional Department of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine (Odessa); Khmelnytsky branch – with Havrylivskii rural council, Gorodotskii district council of Khmelnytsky region, etc.

Lecturers from branches are invited to deliver lectures in other higher education institutions and the teaching staff from other higher education institutions from Ukraine are invited to lecture at the IAPM's branches. Internal teaching staff mobility (mobility between the branches of the IAPM) is present.

**Strengths:**

1. the internationalization is prioritized in a set of the IAPM's internal regulations;
2. cooperation agreements with public and private institutions and professionals from the related region are concluded.

**Weaknesses:**

1. the level of internationalization is low;
2. academic staff is not active in the international mobility programmes;
3. there is lack of outgoing student international mobility;
4. there is lack of incoming international academic mobility of students and teaching staff;
5. no action plan for the internationalization at the IAPM.

**Recommendations:**

1. to elaborate the annual internationalization Action Plan, which shall include special actions aimed at the internationalization of master studies in Law;
2. to intensify the dissemination of the information on the international academic mobility among teaching staff;
3. to broaden the network with the international education and research institutions and conclude the agreements with foreign higher education institutions aimed, in particular, at encouragement of international academic mobility for students and staff;
4. to participate in international academic mobility projects (e.g., Erasmus +)
5. to attract the international professors (including via online options) to deliver lectures for students of the study programme under evaluation;
6. to promote the participation of teaching staff in international educational and research projects;
7. to offer some courses within the study programme in foreign language in order to establish the "academic mobility windows" and attract foreign students;
8. to participate in international educational exhibitions in order to broaden the international cooperation network.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**10. Resources**

IAPM is a privately-owned institution, which has some effect on their financial advantage compared to publicly-owned universities of Ukraine.

The cost of tuition at IAPM's branches is lower compared to similar universities in the regions which definitely affects the choice of students, when they are choosing a higher education institution. Also, for certain categories of students are available tuition discounts.

It can be seen that funds are allocated from the budget of IAPM for the purchase of computer equipment, educational literature, maintenance of dormitories in all branches during the 2019-2020 budget year. This indicates that IAPM is constantly updating and increasing the level of logistics, information support and improves the conditions of study and living of students.

The infrastructure of the Zhytomyr branch includes: the educational building, sufficient auditorium fund, the library and the reading room, the sports ground and the gym, the health center, the legal clinic and the student cafe. The buildings meet fire safety requirements.

The infrastructure of the Odessa branch includes: the educational building, the library and the reading room, the equipped computer class, the conference hall, equipped auditoriums, sports hall, the legal clinic, and the cafeteria. The branch has properly organized fire safety and accessibility of the environment for people with disabilities. Living conditions in the dormitory are properly organized.

The infrastructure of Khmelnytsky branch includes: the educational building, classrooms equipped with multimedia equipment, the library and the reading room, the equipped computer class, the gym, the museum of history of the Institute, the legal clinic, cafeteria, and the assembly hall. The dormitory has comfortable living conditions for students. The buildings meet fire safety requirements.

The infrastructure of the Lutsk branch includes: the educational building, classrooms of proper level, the computer class, the library, the reading room, the legal clinic, the modern conference hall, and the canteen. The buildings meet fire safety requirements. The dormitory rooms have proper conditions.

The infrastructure of the Kherson branch includes: the educational building, classrooms with multimedia, the equipped computer class, the legal clinic, the assembly hall, sports ground, the cafeteria, and cafe. The dormitory has satisfactory living conditions for students. The buildings meet fire safety requirements. The Kherson branch has a higher level of accessibility of the environment in comparison with other branches of IAPM.

The infrastructure of Kropyvnytskyi branch includes: the educational building, classrooms with multimedia equipment, the computer class, the library and the reading room, the legal clinic, the assembly hall, gym, and the cafeteria. The buildings meet fire safety requirements. The dormitory has comfortable living conditions.

In general, financial, logistical resources and educational and methodological support of the educational program encourages the achievement of goals and program learning outcomes which are defined for the study program under evaluation.

All branches of IAPM mentioned above have classrooms equipped with multimedia boards and projectors.

Some classrooms are equipped with information stands, boards, which contain a variety of legal information.

All branches of IAPM mentioned above provide free access for teachers and students to the appropriate infrastructure and information resources.

The educational environment is safe for the life and health of students and allows them to satisfy their needs and interests.

All classrooms, staff rooms, teacher`s room, training and support facilities meet health and fire safety requirements.

The total fund of the library is 357,220,000 units, as well as 80 different editions are subscribed for the needs of students.

Textbooks of Ukrainian authors predominate in library funds. Among the foreign literature is mainly scientific articles on legal issues.



Regarding the library fund of each of the branches, they provide students with educational literature from the study program.

All students have access to the electronic library of IAPM such as: International library and information center named after Yaroslav Mudryi IAPM (<http://library.iapm.edu.ua/>).

Institutes use the Moodle system, which contains online lectures for study disciplines of the study program under evaluation.

All branches actively use information and communication technologies and platforms such as: Google Class, Zoom, Skype, Telegram, Instagram, Facebook, and Prometheus. For example, teachers use Google Class, Zoom, Skype for lectures and practical classes with students during quarantine. Students have the opportunity to take educational courses on the Prometheus platform. Through Telegram students can communicate with teachers in case of questions, receiving information about classes or others. IAPM has official site in Facebook (<https://uk-ua.facebook.com/maup.com.ua/>) and Instagram ([https://www.instagram.com/maup\\_official/](https://www.instagram.com/maup_official/)) Through this sites students find information about various news, events at the IAPM, take part in competitions, flash mobs and sharing the actual information.

Students have access to the public information (<http://maup.com.ua/ua/pro-akademiyu/dostup-do-publichnoi-informacii.html>, <http://maup.zt.ua/publicly.html>, <http://www.maup.km.ua/informaciya/normativni-dokumenti/>, <http://volyn.maup.com.ua/pro-institut/navchannya-v-instituti.html>, <http://maup.com.ua/ua/navchannya-u-maup/library/metod.html>, <http://odessamaup.pp.ua/about-institute/>). External users, including potential students can easily get the necessary information about admission to the IAPM, the features of the study programme, the main regulatory documents connected with the study process, schedules of the study process. Also get acquainted with samples of documents and activities of structural units. All relevant information timely and sufficiently published on the web site of IAPM. During the review of the website, the expert group came to the conclusion that all public information is correct, up-to-date and gives sufficient information to external users, including potential students.

### **Strengths:**

1. financial and logistical resources (classrooms, libraries, dormitories and other infrastructure objects), as well as educational and methodological support of the study program are sufficient to achieve the defined goals and program learning outcomes;
2. free access to all available resources and infrastructure necessary for studying, teaching and / or research activities within the educational program is provided;
3. students from socially vulnerable categories, graduates, employees and their families, winners of national competitions are provided with benefits in tuition fees.

### **Weaknesses:**

1. in all branches (except Kherson), the availability of the environment is limited by a ramp at the entrance to the institutions, which is insufficient for full accessibility of the educational environment;
2. availability of a minimum number of foreign legal literature and other foreign sources in library funds;
3. the library contains outdated legal literature, especially in the Kherson branch.

### **Recommendations:**

1. to pay attention to increasing the level of inclusion of the environment for people with special educational needs, especially to ensure adequate access to the library;
2. to increase the number of foreign legal literature and other foreign resources in the library's funds of institutes.
3. to update library collections from the legal literature in all branches.

**Assessment:**

<b>Excellent</b>	<b>Good</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Poor</b>	<b>N.r.</b>
	<b>X</b>			

## **11. Research work**

The management of IAPM understands the importance of scientific research in realisation of the master study programme in Law and uses a sufficient number of tools to ensure a sufficiently high research level:

- the internal regulations and standards, determining the procedure of calculation of the academic staff's workload, states the workload allocation for different levels of academic staff with a certain part is meant for scientific work;
- the education establishment management actively stimulates scientific activities of academic staff, paying the publication fee in high level scientific journals, which are in the internationally cited database (SCOPUS; Web of Sciences);
- the publication of academic staff researches in the database of SCOPUS and Web of sciences envisages one-off bonus payments of 400 – 600 EUR, which is a significant amount in Ukrainian circumstances.

Despite the efforts of the IAPM management, not all representatives of academic staff are actively involved in qualitative research, the results of which are published in the database of SCOPUS and Web of Sciences.

At the same time, besides the database of SCOPUS and Web of Sciences, the academic staff is actively using opportunities of another popular database, for example – Copernicus. The academic staff of the study programme and its students regularly participate in scientific activities, such as conferences and workshops, organised by the education establishment itself or its cooperation partners. Such involvement in scientific research activities is useful for both academic staff and students. For the academic staff it is quality improvement, recognition among scientists and students. For students, it is an invaluable experience to conduct scientific research, which is useful for master's studies and further legal practice.

The removal of the master thesis from the study programme content as it is planned by the IAPM is to be considered a major problem. As it was mentioned before, the recently adopted Standard for master studies in Law stipulates the minimum requirements and does not prohibit the implementation of master thesis as an additional form of attestation.

Taking into consideration that an equivalent of writing a scientific paper is not envisaged in a Bachelor programme either, it can lead to a situation when a graduate planning to enrol for a Doctor programme is not ready to write a significant research in the Law .

**Strengths:**

- 1.the elaborated strategy of the education establishment in ensuring the high level of research activities, which is manifested in development of various incentives of material and moral nature;
2. regular organisation of scientific and practical conferences that provides opportunities for publication of researches both for academic staff and students.

**Weaknesses:**

1. regardless the stimulation of research activities, the involvement of the academic staff in high level international researches, the results of which are to be published in internationally cited database, still is not very active;
2. the master study programme in Law does not envisage the development of a master thesis. Development of a master's thesis within the framework of the master's program, increase the research level of the master's students and their supervisors and better prepare the graduates of the master's program for doctoral studies.

**Recommendations:**

1. to offer research opportunities in the EU Member States, taking into consideration Ukraine's rapprochement and progress towards the European Union;
2. to focus on submitting high level publications of the academic staff in internationally edited journals and collected works.
3. to include the writing and defence of a master thesis as a compulsory component of the master study programme.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	<b>X</b>			

**12. Employability of graduates**

There have been no graduates in the study programme yet. After interviews with students and employers, it was found that a majority of students were part-time students who were already working in the sphere of jurisprudence, and a master degree was a step towards career development. A large part of the lecturers involved in the implementation of the study programme are also practicing specialists in jurisprudence, representing courts, bar associations, etc. The importance of the study programme in the respective region was also noted during the meeting with employers, as there was a need for young, competent specialists.

The goals of the study programme are in line with the requirements of the labour market, especially noting the regional scale. Employers are involved in the self-assessment process of the study programme, both by completing the employer surveys and by participating in the study process.

According to the employers (in Kherson), once a month they are invited to the department meetings, where the topicality of the programme is discussed; in addition, they are also involved in conferences organised by the higher education institution (in Khmelnytskyi). Employers' opinions and recommendations are taken into account. For example, employers recommended to supplement the study programme with administrative law issues (in Odessa), as well as bankruptcy law (in Kherson), and the higher education institution immediately made the necessary changes in study content.

At the same time, it should be noted that there have been no written surveys of employers and prospective graduates on labour market prospects.

Employers take part in the Open Days of the higher education institution. Employers are also involved in the Council of Employers, the operation of which is governed by the "Regulation on the Council of Employers". Employers indicated that in order for graduates to be able to start practical work immediately after graduation, the number of practical classes should be increased within the studies. In this case, the new standard has entered into force, in which the internship has been increased from 20 ECTS to 30 ECTS. Employers also noted that the study programme should pay more attention to the international aspect. Regarding the new standard, which determines the structure of the study programme, without envisaging the development of a master thesis, employers indicated that the development of a master thesis would play a very important role in jurisprudence, because it would enable the future specialists in the sphere of jurisprudence not only to analyse and interpret information, but also to improve their academic writing skills. The employers' recommendation is to envisage the development and defence of a master thesis in the study programme.

**Strengths:** There are no graduates yet

**Weaknesses:** There are no graduates yet

**Recommendations:**

1. to consider the possibility to include the development and defence of a Master Thesis in the study programme.

**Assessment:**

Excellent	Good	Average	Poor	N.r.
	X			

**13. Student services**

All branches of IAPM which implement the study programme under evaluation provide students with all the necessary basic material resources for the organization of an effective educational process, as well as with necessary levels of educational environment, including educational, organizational, informational, advisory and social support.

All branches mentioned above regularly conduct questionnaires of students on satisfaction with the educational environment.

Each teacher has consultation hours, when students can get answers to their questions, additional information about educational issues.

During the meeting with the focus group, students noted that they have the opportunity to communicate with teachers both in person and through electronic means of communication and social networks.

Students confirmed that they can easily find the necessary information on the website of institutes, on the information boards and through social networks.

Also, for the convenience of students there is an automated information system "Electronic student cabinet" (Telegram bot) in IAPM, which includes information about assessments, payments, class schedules, and academic debt sessions.

The administration of the institutes is open to communication with students regarding organizational, educational and informational support.

Also, the legal clinics which provide a practical component of education are established at the institutes.

There are no foreign students and students with special needs on the study program. However, in general, appropriate support is provided for such students in IAPM.

There are psychological services on the basis of institutions in order to solve psychological problems, facilitate the processes of adaptation and interaction of students.

Educational support is provided at the appropriate level in the institutes.

During the year, the library organizes information days, exhibitions of new additions, presentations of educational and scientific literature. scientific conferences.

Career support for students is provided through close cooperation with employers and regular organization of career events.

Students can receive the necessary support from the student government, teachers, dean's office.

The institutes have a system of individual consultations, which facilitate communication between students and teachers.

Part-time students have the opportunity to attend lectures of full-time students.

During the meetings with the focus groups, students noted the sufficient level of educational, organizational, informational, advisory and social support.

The IAPM has a permanent position of student ombudsperson who represents students before the administration in management of conflict situations.

This mechanism of interaction between the students and the management has proved effective through being able to respond promptly to conflict situations involving sexual harassment, discrimination and corruption.

Students have the opportunity to use the Trust Box by enclosing a written request for resolving a conflict situation (related to sexual harassment, corruption, discrimination).

The institutes have the Code of Ethics, the main task of which is to systematize the moral guidelines of professional activity, as well as to establish a single system of criteria for assessing the ethical principles of professional conduct and activities.

In case of conflict, the student may contact the representatives of the student government or with the ombudsman and, if necessary, the issue may be referred to the meeting of the Academic Council or another representative of the institute's management.

During the meetings with students, teachers and the management of the IAPM experts noted the openness of the IAPM, transparency of policy and speed of response to problematic issues.

Regarding the implementation of the sports component of students' lives, each branch has a sports ground and a gym.

Brain rings, round tables, legal quests, quizzes, sports events, competitions, cultural evenings are constantly organized for students.

In general, students demonstrated a sufficient level of satisfaction with all the services provided by the institutes.

**Strengths:**

1. all branches of the IAPM that implement the study programme under evaluation provide educational, organizational, informational, advisory, social, career and psychological support for students at the appropriate level;
2. IAPM uses all possible resources to improve the educational environment, its adaptation to the needs of students;
3. IAPM takes into account the opinions of students, their suggestions and comments. The policy of the IAPM adheres to the principles of openness and transparency in its activities;
4. students are proud of their higher education institution and are glad that they chose the IAPM as their place of studies.

**Weaknesses:**

1. during the meetings, students emphasized that they wanted to be involved in the process of solving the problems of their community and expressed a desire to create conditions for closer communication between students of different branches of the IAPM;
2. lack of non-formal education events for student youth, which includes not only educational courses and international exchanges and programs, but also trainings, internship, master classes, educational clubs, lectures outside the traditional education system;
3. lack of IAPM's regulations that established a single procedure for resolving conflict situations.

**Recommendations:**

1. to involve the students to solve community problems;
2. to create the conditions for closer communication between students of different branches of the IAPM;
3. to adopt the IAPM's regulation that would stipulate the unified procedure for resolution of conflict situations.
4. to arrange more activities for student youth, including training, non-formal education events, interactive events, trainings for students on the development of sociability, leadership, critical, creative thinking, emotional intelligence, acquisition of managerial, organizational skills and others.

**Assessment:**

<b>Excellent</b>	<b>Good</b>	<b>Average</b>	<b>Poor</b>	<b>N.r.</b>
	<b>X</b>			